

THE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION MEETING WAS HELD AT BEACHWOOD CITY HALL ON THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 28, 2013.

ROLL CALL:	PRESENT:	C. Cohen, M. Gorden. R. Hecht, M. Jacobs,
	ABSENT:	B. Mann, M. Wachter, B. Zabell
	ALSO PRESENT:	M.A. Cannon, W. Griswold, T. Kreczko G. Smerigan

A motion was made by C. Cohen and seconded by R. Hecht to approve the minutes of the January 31, 2013, regular meeting.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, M. Gorden, R. Hecht
	NAYS:	None
	ABSTAIN:	M. Jacobs
		MOTION APPROVED

COUNCIL REPORT

Council Representative, Mel Jacobs, reported that Council referred to the Planning and Zoning Commission Ordinance 2013-17, amending BCO Chapter 1141, Signs in Motor Service District. Also, Council held a public hearing on February 4, 2013 to approve and adopt Ord. 2012-266 amending BCO Chapters 1101 and 1124 regarding Parking and Ground Area coverage and repealing Sections 1101.34 and 1124.04.

P&Z 2013-4	BEACHWOOD BOUTIQUE HOTEL, LLC, IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY AND FINAL APPROVAL FOR A LOT SPLIT FOR PP#742-35-005, FOR A FUTURE PROJECT.
------------	--

Mr. Scott Berkowitz, 23423 Letchworth Road, representing Beachwood Boutique Hotel, is requesting preliminary and final site plan approval for a lot split for the future location of a restaurant.

Mr. Griswold stated that the Building, Fire and Police Departments have no comments on this application.

Mr. Kreczko stated that the creation of the new lot would require an ingress/egress access easement from the original lot to the newly created lot. This easement needs to be recorded at the same time as the lot split plat is recorded.

Mr. Smerigan stated that this request is for preliminary and final approval of a lot split plat that would create a 1.0002 acre parcel for the future construction of a restaurant adjacent to the Aloft hotel, which is presently under construction. At the time the hotel was approved, the applicant indicated its intent to also construct a restaurant on the subject site. This site is located in the U-10 Planned Mixed-Use Development District, which requires a minimum lot area for a hotel of 3.0 acres and a minimum lot area for a restaurant of 1.0 acres. The applicant presently has a total of 3.936 acres of land. Therefore this lot split will require a variance for acreage.

February 28, 2013

Mr. Smerigan continued that the new lot would have its only frontage on Richmond Road. The proposed lot would conform to the minimum lot area and frontage requirements for restaurants in the U-10 Planned Mixed-Use District. However, the Commission will recall that the approval of the hotel development included several stipulations, including a limitation on curb cuts to Richmond Road. Access to the subject site was to be limited to a right-in-only drive from Eaton Boulevard and full access from the common driveway on Eaton Boulevard that also services Lifetime Fitness. In order to maintain the City's traffic planning concepts for this area, it will be necessary to deed restrict the new parcel to prohibit direct driveway access onto Richmond Road. Since all access to the new lot would be across the Aloft parcel, cross access easements between the new parcel and the hotel parcel will also be required.

Since this is a lot split plat, it will require approval by City Council. Should the Planning and Zoning Commission determine to recommend approval of the lot split to City Council, the following stipulations and conditions are recommended: 1) submission of an executed deed restriction in favor of the City of Beachwood and in a form acceptable to the Law Department that there will be no direct driveway access from the subject parcel onto Richmond Road; 2) submission of cross access and parking easements with the Aloft hotel parcel to provide suitable access to the subject site in a form acceptable to the Law Department; 3) compliance with the comments of the City Engineer; and 4) this approval is contingent upon approval by City Council of a lot area variance for the residue parcel.

Chairperson Hecht asked the applicant if he would comply with the stipulations of the easement that will be created.

Mr. Berkowitz stated that the applicant will comply with the required deed restrictions and the stipulations required by the City of Beachwood and approval by the Law Department.

A motion was made by C. Cohen and seconded by M. Jacobs to approve and recommend to Council the request of Beachwood Boutique Hotel, LLC for the preliminary and final approval for a lot split for PP#742-35-005 with the following stipulations and conditions: 1) submission of an executed deed restriction in favor of the City of Beachwood and in a form acceptable to the Law Department that there will be no direct driveway access from the subject parcel onto Richmond Road; 2) submission of cross access and parking easements with the Aloft hotel parcel to provide suitable access to the subject site in a form acceptable to the Law Department; 3) compliance with the comments of the City Engineer; and 4) this approval is contingent upon approval by City Council of a lot area variance for the residue parcel.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, M. Gorden, R. Hecht, M. Jacobs
	NAYS:	None
	MOTION APPROVED – RECOMMEND TO COUNCIL	
	March 18, 2013 Council meeting	

BEACHWOOD BOUTIQUE HOTEL, LLC, IS REQUESTING
PRELIMINARY AND FINAL APPROVAL FOR A VARIANCE OF
.063 ACRES TO PERMIT PP#742-35-005 TO BE 3.0397 ACRES IN
LIEU OF 4.0 ACRES.

Mr. Scott Berkowitz, 23423 Letchworth Road, representing Beachwood Boutique Hotel, is requesting preliminary and final site plan approval for a variance to the permitted acreage per the parcel of land located at 1010 Eaton Boulevard for the future location of a restaurant.

Mr. Griswold stated that approval is recommended by the Building Department, Fire Department and Police Department and would defer to the comments of the City Planner.

Mr. Kreczko stated that all the engineering issues have been previously addressed.

Mr. Smerigan stated that this request is for approval of a variance to the minimum lot area requirement for a hotel parcel in the U-10 Planned Mixed-Use Development District. The Zoning Code requires a minimum of 3.0 acres of land for hotel sites in the U-10 District. With the approval of the companion lot split application that appears on the agenda as P&Z 2013-05, the residue parcel that contains the Aloft hotel will be reduced to a total of 2.93 acres in area. The amount of the requested variance is 0.07 acre or 2,998 square feet. That is a variance of just over two percent (2.2%) of the Code requirement.

In this instance, the amount of the variance is very small, and the request is consistent with the overall development plan presented by the applicant for the subject site. Approval of the variance would need to be conditioned on compliance with several stipulations. Since this request is for a variance, approval will require confirmation by City Council. Should the Planning and Zoning Commission determine to recommend approval of the variance to City Council, the following stipulations and conditions are recommended: 1) pursuant to Section 1159.04, it is determined that a practical difficulty exists or will result from the literal enforcement of the Zoning Code with regard to the provisions of Section 1132.03(a) relating to minimum required lot area, 2) granting of a variance of 2,887 square feet or 0.07 acre to Section 1132.04(a) to permit the total area of the parcel to be 2.93 acres in lieu of the 3.0 acres required by Code; and 3) submission of cross access and parking easements with the proposed restaurant parcel to provide suitable access in conformance with the previously approved development plan and in a form acceptable to the Law Department.

A motion was made by C. Cohen and seconded by M. Jacobs to approve and recommend to Council the request of Beachwood Boutique Hotel, LLC for a variance of .063 acres to permit PP#742-35-005 to be 2.934 in lieu of 3.0 acres required by the Beachwood Codified Ordinance with the following stipulations: 1) pursuant to Section 1159.04, it is determined that a practical difficulty exists or will result from the literal enforcement of the Zoning Code with regard to the provisions of Section 1132.03(a) relating to minimum required lot area, 2) granting of a variance of 2,887 square feet or 0.07 acre to Section 1132.04(a) to permit the total area of the parcel to be 2.93 acres in lieu of the 3.0 acres required by Code; and 3) submission of cross access and parking easements with the proposed restaurant parcel to provide suitable access in conformance with the previously approved development plan and in a form acceptable to the Law Department.

Planning and Zoning Commission
Minutes/Page 4
February 28, 2013

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, M. Gorden, R. Hecht, M. Jacobs
	NAYS:	None

MOTION APPROVED – RECOMMEND TO COUNCIL
March 18, 2013

P&Z 2013-6

THE RICHARD E. JACOBS GROUP, INC., ON BEHALF OF CHAGRIN HIGHLANDS, LTD. IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY AND FINAL APPROVAL OF A LOT SPLIT PLAT CREATING A 4.1783 ACRE PARCEL FROM PP#742-39-001 ON HARVARD ROAD.

Mr. Carl Frey, representing The Richard E. Jacobs Group, Inc., on behalf of Chagrin Highlands Ltd., was present to request preliminary and final approval for a lot split plan creating a 4.1783 acre parcel on Harvard Road for the proposed Alzheimer's Senior Memory Care Center just west of the Beachwood Rehabilitation Center.

Mr. Griswold would recommend approval of this application.

Mr. Kreczko stated that the Engineering Department would recommend approval.

Mr. Smerigan stated that this request is for preliminary and final approval of a lot split plat that would create a 4.18 parcel for the future construction of the JEA Senior Living facility, which has received preliminary site plan approval. This site is located in the U-10 Planned Mixed-Use Development District, which requires a minimum lot area of 3.0 acres. The new lot would have frontage on both Harvard Road and the future connector road to Commerce Park. The proposed lot would conform to the minimum lot area and frontage requirements for lots in U-10 District. The lot split as proposed would preserve a strip of land 100 feet in width between this parcel and the rehabilitation facility parcel to the east that would be the location of the future connector road.

Mr. Smerigan stated that since this request is for a lot split plat, it will also require approval by City Council. Should the Planning and Zoning Commission determine to recommend approval of the lot split to City Council, that recommendation should be conditioned on compliance with the comments of the City Engineer.

A motion was made by C. Cohen and seconded by M. Jacobs to approve and recommend to Council the request of the Richard E. Jacobs Group, Inc. on behalf of Chagrin Highlands Ltd., for preliminary and final approval for a lot split plat creating a 4.1783 acre of land from PP#742-39-001 on Harvard Road.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen. M. Gorden, R. Hecht, M. Jacobs
	NAYS:	None
MOTION APPROVED – RECOMMEND TO COUNCIL		
March 4, 2013		

Planning and Zoning Commission
Minutes/Page 5
February 28, 2013

P&Z 2013-7

THE RICHARD E. JACOBS GROUP, INC. ON BEHALF OF CHAGRIN HIGHLANDS, LTD., IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY AND FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL FOR THE PROPOSED NEW

AND REPLACEMENT SIGNAGE AT ONE CHAGRIN
HIGHLANDS, 2000 AUBURN DRIVE.

Mr. Carl Frey representing The Richard E. Jacobs Group, Inc. presented to the Planning and Zoning Commission the proposed new and replacement signage at One Chagrin Highlands. There are two walls signs on the building; new directional signs on the entry driveways; new directory signs on both sides of the building and new entry and directional signs on Park East.

Mr. Griswold stated that the Building Department has reviewed the new and proposed signage and believe that there it is a reasonable amount of signage for the parcel of land.

Mr. Kreczko stated that there were no engineering issues with this application.

Mr. Smerigan stated that this request is for approval of new and replacement signage for the One Chagrin Highlands building which is located in the U-10 Planned Mixed-Use Development District. As the Planning and Zoning Commission is aware, all signage in the U-10 District requires approval by the Commission. Pursuant to the Code requirements the applicant has submitted a complete sign package that consists of a total of seven (7) signs.

Signs 1 and 2 are wall signs. These signs are 3 feet in height and 54 feet in length for a total of 162 square feet each. They consist of individual LED letters with plastic faces. The faces are white with black trim. The size, location, and colors appear reasonable and consistent with the design and scale of the building.

Sign 3 is a wayfinding sign located along the main entry driveway to the site from Auburn Drive. This sign is a single sided non-illuminated aluminum directional sign approximately 22 square feet in area and 8 feet in height that is mounted on a masonry base with a stone cap. The sign provides directions to visitor and handicapped parking and for deliveries. The base is consistent with the Chagrin Highlands sign standards. The sign face is white with black copy and the Cleveland Clinic logo.

Signs 4 and 5 are identical monument signs mounted in front of the main entries to the building and provide a directory of tenants. These signs are also single sided, non-illuminated, and made of fabricated aluminum with applied vinyl copy. Signs 4 and 5 are 8 feet in height and 6 feet in width for a total of 48 square feet in area per sign. Again, with the exception of the Cleveland Clinic logo, the color scheme is black and white. These signs are designed to match the façade treatment of the building.

Signs 6 and 7 are monument signs that are located at the driveway entrance off of Park East Drive, identifying the building and address. Sign 6 is approximately 36 square feet in area and 8 feet in height. It is Chagrin Highland colors and is mounted on a masonry base with the stone cap. Sign 7 is also a monument sign with the same dimensions as sign 6 located on the opposite side of the Park East Drive.

Planning and Zoning Commission
Minutes/Page 6
February 28, 2013

The only exception to THE typical sign situation is the placement of two monument signs at the drive entrance off Park East Drive. In this instance with the Clinic being located there, it would be beneficial to the people coming from the hotels and from out of town to have the sign identification there.

Mr. Smerigan stated that if the Commission recalls, sign packages in the U-10 Planned Mixed-Use District are at the discretion of the Commission. Signs 3, 6, and 7, which can be viewed from off-site are all consistent with the approved Chagrin Highlands sign standards. Signs 4 and 5 are not visible from off-site, but can only be seen from the building's parking lots. These two signs are compatible with the architectural treatment of the building, so they are internally consistent. Signs 1 and 2, while visible off-site, are also consistent with the design and architectural treatment of the building. The amount of signage and its placement appear reasonable for this building in this zoning district. Although two entry signs are unusual in other districts, the dual purpose of identifying the building and address for the non-Clinic tenants and identifying the Clinic for those unfamiliar with the location appears to be reasonable. The Planning and Zoning Commission has final authority to approve, deny, or modify this sign package request.

Mr. Cohen questioned the location of the address placement of the signs on Auburn Drive compared to the location of the two signs at the Park East entrance. The address sign at Auburn is at the entrance with the wayfinding sign located further down the driveway. At Park East the signs are both at the driveway entrance.

Mr. Smerigan stated that if you enter from the Auburn Drive you have already found the location of the street, on which the building is located. The wayfinding sign, which is the sign located farther down the driveway, directs you after you have entered the site. On Park East you have a driveway, but the address of the building is not on Park East. Having the Auburn Drive address sign located there as well as the Cleveland Clinic identification would be beneficial for the persons not familiar with the area.

A motion was made by M. Jacobs and seconded by R. Hecht to grant the request of The Richard E. Jacobs Group, Inc., on behalf of Chagrin Highlands, Ltd., for preliminary and final site plan approval of the proposed new and replacement signage at One Chagrin Highlands, 2000 Auburn Drive.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	M. Gorden, R. Hecht, M. Jacobs
	NAYS:	C. Cohen
	MOTION APPROVED –	

Planning and Zoning Commission
Minutes/Page 7
February 28, 2013

Adjournment

Rochelle Hecht, Chairman

Sue Ley, Secretary

Karen Navolanic, Clerk of Council