

THE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION MEETING WAS HELD AT BEACHWOOD CITY HALL ON THURSDAY, APRIL 27, 2017.

Chairman Hecht stated they are live and recording tonight from Beachwood City Hall.

ROLL CALL:	PRESENT:	Mayor Gorden, C. Cohen, R. Hecht, B. Mann, J. Pasch, B. Zabell
	ABSENT:	O. Jacobs
	ALSO PRESENT:	J. Ciuni, W. Griswold, H. Jones, G. Smerigan

Chairman Hecht welcomed Mel Jacobs to the meeting.

A motion was made by C. Cohen and seconded by M. Gorden to approve the Planning and Zoning Commission minutes dated March 30, 2017, regular meeting.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht
	NAYS:	None
	ABSTAIN:	B. Mann, B. Zabell
	NOT VOTING:	J. Pasch
	MOTION	– MINUTES NOT APPROVED

COUNCIL REPORT

Mr. James Pasch, Council Representative, stated Council adopted P&Z 2017-2(A), a motion accepting preliminary and final approval for a revised lot split and consolidation of PPN 741-15-004, 741-15-005, 741-15-006, 741-15-007, 741-15-008 and 741-15-009, pursuant to the Development Agreement between the owner and the City of Beachwood. City Council adopted P&Z 2017-7, a motion accepting preliminary and final approval for a lot split and consolidation of 2361 Beachwood Boulevard (PPN 741-11-046) and 2367 Beachwood Boulevard (PPN 741-11-004, 741-11-005) to increase rear yard. Planning and Zoning Ordinance No. 2017-54, an Ordinance submitted upon the proposal of a citizen to amend BCO Section 1121.02(A), titled 'Permitted Uses,' to allow for drive-thrus in Class U-4A Districts under specific circumstances was placed on first reading and sent to Planning and Zoning to study the issue per required under the Ohio Revised Code.

Chairman Hecht stated Chairman Orry Jacobs is out of town and had asked her to Chair the meeting.

P&Z 2016-21(A)	MARCO CICCARELLI, STUDIOTECHNE ARCHITECTS, REPRESENTING GREEN ROAD SYNAGOGUE, IS REQUESTING FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL FOR A NEW SYNAGOGUE TO BE LOCATED AT 2437 SOUTH GREEN ROAD.
----------------	--

Mr. Marco Ciccarelli, StudioTechne Architects, representing Green Road Synagogue, was present to request final site plan approval for a new synagogue to be located at 2437 South Green Road. Currently, it is about a five (5) acre parcel and the building sits in the front. They are proposing to build about a 38,000 square foot new facility behind the existing building, maintain the existing building while they are under construction. At the end of construction open up the new building and demolish the existing building. The pedestrian entrance is off Timberlane and the vehicular entrance off South Green Road. The site will be changed slightly as the grade will have to be dropped 3-4 feet in the back in order to meet the finished floor level. New utilities will be brought in, there are four (4) fire hydrants around the property and they will have a fire department connection at the vault at the street. The plan for storm water prevention is they will actually have less paved area in the future than they do currently which has been reviewed with EPA and local jurisdiction. They do not require a detention basin and they will have a bio-swale at the end of the parking lot.

Chairman Hecht asked the age of the existing building.

Mr. Ciccarelli replied the existing building was built in the early 1970's.

Mr. Griswold stated the applicant indicated he had located fire hydrants. When the Fire Department reviewed it their indication was the plan failed to denote but they will review both the location of hydrant and FDC placement. That FDC placement is where the Fire Department approves where it is located. Building size and type of occupancy will require sprinkler system and fire alarm system throughout.

Mr. Ciuni stated in the last two (2) weeks they have responded to their comments and they still need Cleveland Water approval, Ohio EPA for NOI (Notice of Intent) and Cuyahoga County Sanitary Engineer approval. At this time, approval is recommended.

Mr. Pasch asked the construction timeline schedule for the new building and tear down of old building.

Mr. Ciccarelli stated work on the new building will begin mid-July, for construction completion June of 2018 and within a week or so the fencing will be moved and begin demolition of the other building. By September the entire project will be complete.

Mr. Pasch asked in the interim, where is everyone to park.

Mr. Ciccarelli replied they are limiting the activities that will occur in the synagogue. They are proposing to gravel the front grass area and use that as parking which could accommodate approximately thirty (30) cars.

Mr. Smerigan stated this request is for final site plan approval to construct a new synagogue and is consistent with the previously approval preliminary site plan and there are no changes. He would note that one of the issues talked about on the preliminary was the mounding landscaping to the homes across Timberlane. As you can see they did the mounding and extensive landscaping to buffer those homes. The landscaping plan is adequately done. The application includes a site lighting plan with fixtures and photometric levels that comply with City standards. Final site plan approval is recommended subject to any comments and recommendations of the City Engineer.

Mayor Gorden advised Mr. Pasch they did address parking during construction during a previous meeting and the Administration was satisfied with that.

Mayor Gorden asked how many access points there were as far as gates with the new construction fence around the property. From an emergency standpoint he wants to make sure we have access on the side street.

Mr. Ciccarelli replied they had planned a pedestrian gate towards Timberlane only but they can revise that and increase that size to a double gate. The only gate that is vehicular access would be at the end of drive off Green Road.

Mayor Gorden stated he would like to see a larger gate off that side for emergency access only.

Mr. Cohen asked would the owners be amenable to use similar like materials to the building to make it more attractive rather than the board on board construction fence around the transformer and dumpster area.

Mr. Ciccarelli replied they will do the masonry around the dumpster as that is a requirement of the City. There is not a lot of room around the gas house and they are trying to make it unnoticeable as possible instead of building a large masonry structure around it. Without the masonry, it allows them to have plants and vines on the fence. If they do that area with masonry, they will not have room to landscape. The landscaping will help diminish the appearance of that item.

Mr. Cohen asked if the fire pit located on the site is wood burning or gas burning and to determine the correct distance.

Mr. Ciccarelli relied currently wood burning.

Mr. Griswold stated the Fire Department will review as it falls under the purview of both City Code and Fire Code and he will bring his concerns to the attention of the Fire Chief.

A motion was made by B. Mann and seconded by J. Pasch to approve Marco Ciccarelli, StudioTechne Architects, representing Green Road Synagogue, request for final site plan approval for a new synagogue to be located at 2437 South Green Road subject to the comments and recommendations of the City Engineer and submission of light fixture details for approval of the Administration.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Mann, J. Pasch, B. Zabell
	NAYS:	None
MOTION APPROVED		

Chairman Hecht welcomed Councilman Justin Berns to the meeting.

Ms. Jones stated a motion was needed to omit submission of light fixtures details for approval of the Administration from prior motion as it was an error.

A motion was made by R. Hecht and seconded by B. Mann to approve Marco Ciccarelli, StudioTechne Architects, representing Green Road Synagogue, request for final site plan approval for a new synagogue to be located at 2437 South Green Road subject to the comments and recommendations of the City Engineer

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Mann, J. Pasch, B. Zabell
	NAYS:	None
MOTION APPROVED		

P&Z 2017-4(A)	NATHAN ANDERSON, EDWARD ROSE & SONS, IS REQUESTING FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL FOR PROPOSED 3-STORY SENIOR LIVING FACILITY TO BE LOCATED AT PPN 742-38-002, HARVARD ROAD.
---------------	---

Mr. Nathan Anderson, Edward Rose & Sons, along with Chris Howard and Aaron Appell, Bramhall Engineering, was present to request final site plan approval for 3-story senior living facility to be located at PPN 742-38-002, Harvard Road. It is a ten (10) acre site just west of Eaton Boulevard and north of Harvard Road. It is a 174 unit senior living facility. The detention is on the far west side, attached garages, car ports, dumpster behind the building, and access on Harvard Road. One additional detail provided on final site plan submittal was fence details. Also, a full set of civil engineering drawings were provided as part of final site plan submittal. They received comments from City Engineer and resubmitted them this morning addressing the comments.

Mr. Griswold stated Fire Department had indicated on their review the FDC need to be determined prior the underground fire water line being installed and the applicant did indicate a fence around the detention basin but they area also requesting the location of the fence gate opening.

Mr. Ciuni stated he received the civil drawings with responses to his comments along with a letter of disposition. He has not reviewed 100 percent but what he reviewed they have complied with all of his comments and at this time he recommends approval.

Mr. Smerigan stated this request is in conformance with the previously approved preliminary plan. The plan indicates three different fence types. The dog park fence is black aluminum, the privacy fence for the memory care outdoor area is tan vinyl, and the detention basin fence is black vinyl coated chain link. In his opinion, the fence around the detention basin should be the black aluminum, same as around the dog park. That would be

consistent with the other developments along Harvard Road have done in terms of their detention basins. The landscaping plan is fairly extensive and they have done a very good job. The photometric plan does meet their requirements. The lighting plan does show cut-off fixtures but does not identify the fixtures. They have not chosen the final light fixtures at this point.

Final site plan approval is recommended subject to:

1. The comments and recommendations of the City Engineer.
2. Submission of light fixture details for approval by the Administration.
3. Fencing around the detention basin be changed to black aluminum to match the fencing at the dog park.

Mr. Anderson stated he is fine with having the detention basin fence match the dog park fencing.

Mayor Gorden stated he met with the ownership and top management of Edward Rose & Sons last week and they had a great meeting. He arranged a meet and greet with the top supervision of Ahuja Hospital so they could build a relationship between their facility and Ahuja. The same offering was made to the Cleveland Clinic but he is not sure they have responded yet. In dealing with your team, they were the upmost professional and very cooperative to speak with. He would appreciate it much if he would take that back to them.

Mr. Anderson thanked him for the kind words.

A motion was made by B. Mann and seconded by B. Zabell to approve Nathan Anderson, Edward Rose & Sons, request for final site plan approval for 3-story senior living facility to be located at PPN 742-38-002, Harvard Road with the following stipulations: 1) The comments and recommendations of the City Engineer; 2) Submission of light fixture details for approval by the Administration; and 3) Fencing around the detention basin be changed to black aluminum to match the fencing at the dog park.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Mann, J. Pasch, B. Zabell
	NAYS:	None
	MOTION APPROVED	

P&Z 2017-8

MICHAEL CUCCIARRE, VOCON, ON BEHALF OF M4 REALTY, LLC, IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY AND FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL FOR PARKING EXPANSION AT 25975 CENTRAL PARKWAY, BUICK GMC OF BEACHWOOD.

Mr. Michael Cucciarre, Vocon, on behalf of M4 Realty LLC, was present to request approval for parking expansion at 25975 Central Parkway, Buick GMC of Beachwood. It is a fairly simple parking lot expansion with no variances to be granted. The purpose is for additional vehicle inventory. Currently, there are approximately 200-215 parking spots on the site and are looking to increase it by about 55 spots.

Mr. Griswold stated Fire and Building Department have no comments.

Mr. Ciuni stated no stipulations with Engineering on this item. They have complied with everything and recommend approval.

Mr. Smerigan stated this request is for both preliminary and final site plan approval to add 55 paved parking for storage of inventory vehicles. The subject site is zoned U-9 Motor Service District. The applicant is seeking to double stack parking spaces in order to increase the storage space for inventory vehicles. In 2013 the Planning and Zoning Commission approved double stacking of parking spaces to be used solely for storage of inventory vehicles on both the subject site and the adjacent Infinity of Beachwood site. The applicant proposes to construct an additional 55 double or triple stacked parking spaces on the subject site. The site still complies with the

parking requirements of the Zoning Code. These spaces are strictly to accommodate additional vehicle inventory. There are no setback issues associated with the proposed parking lot expansion. There are no issues from zoning standpoint and approval is recommended.

A motion was made by B. Zabell and seconded by J. Pasch to approve Michael Cucciarre, Vocon, on behalf of M4 Realty LLC, request for approval for parking expansion at 25975 Central Parkway, Buick GMC of Beachwood.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Mann, J. Pasch, B. Zabell
	NAYS:	None
MOTION APPROVED		

P&Z 2017-11	AVRIL J. BURG, CLUB ROCK CLEVELAND, IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY AND FINAL APPROVAL FOR A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT AT 23645 MERCANTILE ROAD, SUITE H.
-------------	--

Ms. Avril J. Burg, Club Rock Cleveland, was present to request preliminary and final site plan approval for a conditional use permit at 23645 Mercantile Road, Suite H.

Mr. Griswold stated this space has one (1) exit door. From the Building Department's perspective, there would be a limit in terms of occupancy to 50 or less. That would be a condition we would impose just on the occupancy and suggests it be imposed by the Commission in terms of them moving forward should they approve.

Mr. Ciuni stated there are no Engineering comments on this item.

Mr. Smerigan stated this request is for a Conditional Use Permit for a youth music training facility. Schools and training facilities are a conditionally permitted use in U-8 Districts. The applicant proposes classes with 5-15 students per session with 3-6 adult instructors per session. Section 1129.05(b)(2) requires one parking space for each 400 square feet of floor area for industrial uses and one space for each 200 square feet for schools and training facilities. Based upon the size of the tenant space, the additional parking requirement would only be six (6) spaces. It appears that the subject site is capable of accommodating that difference for normal daily operations of the school.

The applicant is also proposing to use the site for child birthday parties and for concerts. The application indicates that such events would only be scheduled evenings and weekends. Birthday parties would likely significantly increase parking demand, but that increase can probably be accommodated after regular business hours and on weekends if the number of participants is reasonably limited. If they are going to permit child birthday parties, it is his position that they be limited to after 5:30 pm on weekdays or on weekends and be subject to making any safety improvements as indicated as necessary by both the Building and Fire Departments. The applicant also would like to hold concerts on-site and indicates that the concerts bring upwards of 100 attendees. In his opinion, it is not a concert venue space and is a decision the Commission would make as part of the Conditional Use Permit.

Because this is in the U-8 Industrial and Office Mixed-Use District, the Planning and Zoning Commission has final authority to grant or deny the Conditional Use Permit. Should the Commission determine to grant the request, the following stipulations are recommended:

1. This Conditional Use Permit for a youth music school is approved for Club Rock Cleveland only and may not be transferred without the prior approval of the Planning and Zoning Commission.
2. Child birthday parties shall be held only after 5:30 pm on weekdays or on weekends.
3. Concerts shall only be for students of the school and shall only be held on Saturdays or Sundays.

Mr. Griswold stated Fire Department commented it did not appear to have the proper annunciation for fire alarms and that is something the applicant has to speak to the Fire Department about and that would be an additional condition. Both the Fire and Building Department would do an inspection prior to that occupancy being issued.

Ms. Hecht asked where they currently hold concerts.

Ms. Burg stated she picks different venues such as Solon Freeway Lanes, Boneyard, Legacy Village.

Mr. Smerigan stated those sites are designed to handle those types of crowds and are appropriate venues. The training facility is a reasonable and appropriate use for this space but the concert activity is not consistent with that location.

Mr. Mann would like to come to an agreement to where this will be an after school training and pull out the concerts, he would be more in favor than he is now.

Ms. Burg stated pulling out the concerts is fine as she is doing that now and would not be a deal breaker. All her birthday parties are on Saturdays and Sundays.

Mayor Gorden commented he appreciates her remaining in Beachwood as she had to move out of her last location and she is an asset to the community.

Ms. Burg thanked the Mayor and stated she loves Beachwood.

A motion was made by B. Zabell and seconded by C. Cohen to approve Avril J. Burg, Club Rock Cleveland, request for preliminary and final site plan approval for a conditional use permit at 23645 Mercantile Road, Suite H with the following stipulations: 1) This Conditional Use Permit for a youth music school is approved for Club Rock Cleveland only and may not be transferred without the prior approval of the Planning and Zoning Commission; 2) Child birthday parties shall be held only after 5:30 pm on weekdays or on weekends; 3) No concerts shall be held; 4) The maximum occupancy is less than 50 people; and 5) Subject to the comments of the Fire Department and City Engineer.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Mann, J. Pasch, B. Zabell
	NAYS:	None
	MOTION APPROVED	

P&Z 2017-15	KEN VEON, REPRESENTING BEACHWOOD CITY SCHOOLS, AND CHRIS ROMANIN, ROMANIN CONCRETE, INC., IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY AND FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL FOR NEW SERVICE WALK AT EXISTING TWO (2) PARKING LOT ISLANDS AT 2860 RICHMOND ROAD, BEACHWOOD MIDDLE SCHOOL.
-------------	---

Mr. Ken Veon, Director of Operations for Beachwood Schools, was present to request preliminary and final site plan approval for new service walk at existing two (2) parking lot islands at 2860 Richmond Road, Beachwood Middle School. They want to add a safety walk across the parking lot and stripe the parking lot with no change in footprint.

Mr. Griswold stated the Fire Department had no questions. He asked if they were removing lighting poles.

Mr. Veon said the lighting pole is staying in its current location and there are two (2) trees in the middle island that will be removed.

Mr. Ciuni stated Engineering has no issues or problems with the application and recommend approval.

Mr. Smerigan stated this request is for both preliminary and final site plan approval to add a pedestrian walkway from the Middle School building to the athletic fields. Installation of the walkway as proposed would involve removal of two (2) landscape islands in the existing school parking lot. Section 1124.07(i) requires: All parking areas containing more than forty spaces shall contain planting strips or islands to interrupt the mass of paved area, aid in controlling the flow of traffic, and provide visual quality. The parking lot in question has in excess of 100 spaces; therefore, approval of the proposed site plan would require a variance. Variances to Chapter 1124 U-5 Public and Institutional District require the concurrence of City Council.

Typically we like to keep the landscaping in the parking lots; however, in this instance, given the fact you have heavy traffic with school children the safety issue trumps the visual quality issue.

Should the Planning and Zoning Commission wish to recommend approval of the preliminary and final site plan for the Beachwood Middle School to City Council, the following stipulations are required:

1. Pursuant to Section 1159.04 it is determined that a practical difficulty exists or will result on the subject site from the literal enforcement of Zoning Code Section 1124.07(i) with regard to required parking lot landscape islands.
2. Granting a variance to Section 1124.07(i) to permit the removal of two landscaped islands from the existing parking lot.
3. Site plan approval is subject to the comments and recommendations of the City Engineer.

Mr. Pasch agrees in this instance, safety trumps what our Code currently says, but moving forward he thinks it is important with most of the lots throughout the City that have over the 40-50 spaces required by the Code, there is breakage of landscape islands. He does not want it to create a habit of where they carve out exceptions in parking lots throughout the City.

Chairman Hecht stated she totally agrees but in the instance it is for the safety of children.

Mayor Gorden stated they have not had that situation in the past and has not been a problem but his comment is appropriate.

Mayor Gorden asked when the project plans to commence.

Mr. Veon replied June 5th as school ends June 2nd.

Mr. Zabell asked if there is a striped cross walk from the library parking lot to the Middle School.

Mr. Veon commented he does not believe so but could do it during the project this summer. He would have to speak with Mr. Griswold to see where that location would be best served.

Mr. Cohen asked what the driving force is behind this maneuver.

Mr. Veon stated they have not had an accident yet but they do not want to wait till it happens. They are trying to be proactive to avoid any students cutting through the parking lot rather than here's the cross walk, use it.

A motion was made by B. Zabell and seconded by B. Mann to approve Ken Veon, representing Beachwood City Schools, and Chris Romanin, Romanin Concrete, request for preliminary and final site plan approval for new service walk at existing two (2) parking lot islands at 2860 Richmond Road, Beachwood Middle School with the following stipulations: 1) Pursuant to Section 1159.04 it is determined that a practical difficulty exists or will result on the subject site from the literal enforcement of Zoning Code Section 1124.07(i) with regard to required parking lot landscape islands; 2) Granting a variance to Section 1124.07(i) to permit the removal of two

landscaped islands from the existing parking lot; and 3) Site plan approval is subject to the comments and recommendations of the City Engineer.

ROLL CALL: AYES: C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Mann,
J. Pasch, B. Zabell
NAYS: None
MOTION APPROVED - RECOMMENDATION TO
COUNCIL – Monday, May 15, 2017 at 7:00 PM

P&Z 2017-9 JONATHAN KLACZIK, GREAT LAKES FENCE CO., IS REQUESTING
PRELIMINARY AND FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL FOR PHASE II
PERIMETER/SECURITY FENCE TO BE LOCATED AT 26000 VILLAGE
LANE, THE VILLAGE

Mr. Jonathan Klaczik, Great Lakes Fence Co., was present to request preliminary and final site plan approval for Phase II perimeter/security fence to be located at 26000 Village Lane, The Village. This is Phase 2 of the project to continue the security fence around the property with approximately 4,400 linear feet of fencing matching the same fencing already installed at George Zeiger and Richmond Road.

Mr. Griswold stated no comments.

Mr. Ciuni stated he is confused as to where the fence is going to be placed, are there trees to be cleared, is there grading to be done. None of those details were given to him. He requests a survey be done prior to installing the fence so we know you are on your property and not encroaching the adjacent properties.

Mr. Klaczik replied a survey has been done and the property pins have been located and the drawing was provided by the surveyor.

Mr. Ciuni stated he sees a drawing submitted from 1979.

Mr. Klaczik replied they can speak with The Village and submit an updated drawing.

Mr. Ciuni asked about trees, grading, clearing of site.

Mr. Klaczik replied they will be accessing behind all the streets throughout the property. The trees and brush needed to be cleared have already begun. From what they have seen, no grade changing is needed. The fence itself runs with the grade of the property.

Mr. Ciuni commented nothing was submitted for his review.

Chairman Hecht stated typically we do not approve anything without all the documentation and total approval by City Engineer.

Mr. Ciuni stated he requests his inspector be there before they start and is comfortable going forward.

Mayor Gorden asked if they have already started this portion of the property.

Mr. Klaczik replied no.

Mayor Gorden asked if it could be possible to put in some stakes so visually they could be seen so it can make the Engineers job and inspector's jobs easier.

Mr. Klaczik replied absolutely.

Chairman Hecht asked Mr. Ciuni if he was okay with that.

Mr. Ciuni replied yes.

Mr. Griswold stated this cost is going to be covered by the Village so we request an Engineers deposit to cover the cost of having his people out there to verify all that has been staked.

Mayor Gorden asked if this was an extension of the original permit or will a new permit need to be issued.

Mr. Griswold replied it is a new permit which Great Lakes is aware of.

Mr. Smerigan stated this request is for both preliminary and final site plan approval for installation of a perimeter security fence for The Village. This is the second phase of the applicant's fencing project. The Planning and Zoning Commission approved the first phase in July 2014. The fence is black metal six (6) feet in height and will match the fencing used in the initial phase. This phase will continue south down Richmond Road then east and back to the north behind the homes on North Woodland. From a zoning standpoint he has no issues and recommends approval subject to the comments of the City Engineer.

Mr. Pasch stated he has received emails from residents on Meadoway Drive which borders where the fence will be about the maintenance of the buffer zone between the residential property and The Village, concerns about the exact location of the fence, and who is clearing the buffer area. He is more uncomfortable the plans have not been reviewed and submitted before this vote. He would prefer to hold off until that review takes place.

Mr. Zabell stated he is comfortable voting if the City Engineer and Building Department is comfortable with it being located in the right place and supervise the installation.

Mr. Zabell asked if the fence will be visible from Richmond Road.

Mr. Klaczik stated a small portion will be visible from Richmond Road but primarily ends up behind residents. The first phase was on the main road for the majority of the fencing.

Mr. Zabell commented there were some Commission members who expressed concern or reservation about the overall aesthetic and design of the fence itself especially considering how much linear footage was going to be on Richmond Road. At the time he did not have those concerns but in hindsight they should have given those concerns more consideration. He thinks having some pillars or breaks in the fencing along the line of what you have along some of the neighboring properties on George Zeiger would have created a much more desirable look.

Chairman Hecht stated she believes it was Mr. Cohen who was not comfortable with that.

Mr. Klaczik stated the original intent was to install columns going down but the grade prohibited them from being allowed to put the columns up. With concerns of any dumping taking place, this fence will finally divide what the property boundaries are.

Chairman Hecht stated she appreciates Mr. Pasch's comments and she trusts the comments and expertise of their directors. She asked Mr. Ciuni what makes him feel most comfortable.

Mr. Ciuni replied as long as he can verify where they are putting it before they put it up, he would say they could recommend approval.

Mr. Ciuni asked if a fence is being put up right up against the road along North Woodland Road.

Mr. Klaczik replied no, it is a good distance away, approximately 30 plus linear feet from where the fence is going to be installed.

Mr. Pasch commented when the first Phase of fence was presented the purpose was because of security issues. He asked what the purpose of this separate area of The Village is for a six (6) foot fence continuation and what benefit is derived from it.

Mr. Klaczik stated with the first meeting it was their understanding they would continue the fence as part of the agreement with Phase One. There are still issues of people cutting through the neighborhoods behind The Village property to get to George Zeiger and the mall. The Board agreed to spend a significant amount of money to help all those people with those concerns.

Mr. Ciuni stated one more stipulation, if there are any large trees or screening removed after his visit, they would have to replace that with some type of vegetation.

Chairman Hecht stated she does not feel comfortable and wants all the information first and then applicant comes back next month.

Mr. Pasch agrees.

Mayor Gorden asked if there was a time constraint.

Mr. Klaczik replied the only time restraint is for those people who live inside The Village who have been wanting this fence. It has been a few years since Phase One. Walking through the site to make this happen can be scheduled.

Mr. Cohen asked how long the installation will take.

Mr. Klaczik replied 8-12 weeks, weather depending.

Chairman Hecht stated the item will be tabled.

A motion was made by B. Mann and seconded by J. Pasch to table Jonathan Klaczik, Great Lakes Fence Co., request for preliminary and final site plan approval for Phase II perimeter/security fence to be located at 26000 Village Lane, The Village.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Mann, J. Pasch, B. Zabell
	NAYS:	None
MOTION APPROVED –ITEM TABLED		

P&Z 2017-10

CHAD COSTELLO, HASENSTAB ARCHITECTS, ON BEHALF OF MANNA ISLE OHIO, IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN APPROVAL FOR A NEW TWO-STORY ENCORE MEDICAL CENTER TO BE LOCATED AT PPN 742-17-047, CHAGRIN BOULEVARD AND RICHMOND ROAD.

Mr. Chad Costello, Hasenstab Architects, on behalf of Manna Isle Ohio, was present to request preliminary site plan approval for a new two-story Encore Medical Center to be located at PPN 742-17-047, Chagrin Boulevard and Richmond Road. The plan is to develop a two-story, 68,000 square foot medical center consisting of a radiology component, surgery component, a small emergency service component, and a patient care wing on the second floor.

Mr. Griswold stated the Fire Department had several comments regarding this application. The plans failed to denote FDC placement. Although early in planning stages, hydrant and FDC placement will need to be approved by Fire Department. The applicant indicated fencing around the storm water management basin. The canopy denoted in the plan is required to be no less than thirteen (13) feet.

Mr. Ciuni stated they will need to see final civil drawings before the final. At this time, there are no issues and we recommend preliminary.

Mr. Smerigan stated this request is for preliminary site plan approval for a new medical center building to be constructed on the Northwest corner of the intersection of Chagrin Boulevard and Richmond Road. This request would supersede the previously approved three-story office building and restaurant on the subject site. The building will house a specialty surgery center as well as medical offices. The site plan indicates a two-story building containing 67,900 square feet of floor area. The building footprint is 40,400 square feet. The plan provides for a right in and right out only drive on Chagrin Boulevard and an exit only on Bryden Road.

There is no entrance or exit directly to Richmond Road in conformance with the existing deed restriction. The site plan also complies with the restriction of only parking and landscaping on the old Bryden Road vacated right-of-way. Access and parking will still be shared with the adjacent Signature Square complex. The main entrance and a patient drop-off with a porte cochere are located on the western end of the building.

As with the previously approved plan, the applicant proposes to a five feet high landscape mound along the entire northern property line with a board on board fence four feet in height on top of the mound to provide screening for the residential uses across Bryden Road. A mixture of deciduous and evergreen trees is proposed along the mound and fence. This approach should provide adequate screening.

The Zoning Code requires a total of 391 parking spaces. The applicant has provided information regarding their expected parking demand and has requested to install 204 parking spaces now and to landbank the remaining 187 required parking spaces. The proposed site plan indicates placement of all 391 parking spaces if required. The primary areas of landbanking are in the northwest corner, nearest the residences, and along the Chagrin Boulevard and Richmond Road frontages. The landscape plan indicates extensive landscaping in those frontage areas of landbanked parking. The plan includes walking trails, hardscape features, benches, and extensive landscaping. The visual effect is a larger setback from the street and a softer image at this highly visible corner. The opportunity to landbank unneeded parking and to enhance the visual quality of the site is very positive. The Planning and Zoning Commission has authority to authorize landbanking of parking spaces where no reduction in the total required parking is involved.

The applicant has also provided preliminary building façade treatments that tie into elements of the buildings in the adjacent Signature Square complex. The application also includes preliminary information with regard to the overall approach to signage.

The proposed site plan complies with all of the requirements of the U-7A General Office Building District as evidenced in the attached box score. In summary, the proposed plan is an attractive alternative to the previously approved plan with a reduction in building height and elimination of the restaurant use.

Preliminary site plan approval is recommended subject to the following:

1. Permission to landbank 187 parking spaces until such time as it is determined by either the applicant or the Building Commissioner that said parking spaces are required to adequately service the use, at which time the spaces shall be installed in accordance with the final site plan as directed and approved by the Building Commissioner and City Engineer.
2. Submission with the final site development plan of cross access and parking agreements acceptable to the Law Department.
3. Compliance with the comments and recommendations of the City Engineer.

Chairman Hecht asked if this was a medical center/orthopedic surgery center and is there ambulatory, overnight surgery.

Mr. Costello stated there would be overnight surgery. There is a patient wing on the second floor.

Chairman Hecht asked if there were any other Encore Medical Centers located elsewhere or is this brand new.

Mr. Costello replied there is a similar medical center in Oklahoma.

Chairman Hecht asked how many doctors will be on site.

Mr. Costello replied twenty (20) doctors.

Chairman Hecht asked if there were ambulatory services.

Mr. Costello replied there is an ambulance drop off near the small emergency care area. There are two (2) treatment rooms.

Chairman Hecht asked if the walking trails are for post-surgery.

Mr. Costello stated kind of, or for the families of the patients.

Chairman Hecht asked what the estimated payroll would be for the next 2-3 years.

Mr. John Lin, representing the owners, replied 9-10 million over five (5) years.

Mayor Gorden asked will they have some type of food service and is this for patients only.

Mr. Lin replied yes, for patients and families.

Mayor Gorden asked what type of security will be provided since people will be in the building 24-hours a day.

Mr. Lin stated they will have security on a 24-hour basis.

Mr. Mann asked if the center will have any affiliation with the local hospitals.

Mr. Lin stated yes, they will have affiliations with several of the local hospitals. The doctors will be affiliated with other hospitals as well. No hospital will be able to provide all the service all the time.

Mr. Cohen asked how many patient beds are proposed and how many employees.

Mr. Costello replied, 24 patient beds.

Mr. Lin stated approximately 150 support staff over two (2) shifts.

Mr. Costello asked for clarification on the box score regarding building height saying they can go up to 56 feet.

Mr. Smerigan stated the reason the box score shows the maximum building height of 56 feet is because a number of years ago the City granted a variance on this property to permit a taller building to be constructed. The variance runs with the land and is still there. If you wanted to go higher you certainly could. The standard code provision is only 42 feet but since the variance is already granted, the right to go higher already exists on this property.

Mr. Cohen asked if they will be purchasing the land as well.

Mr. Lin replied, yes.

A motion was made by B. Mann and seconded by C. Cohen to approve Chad Costello, Hasenstab Architects, on behalf of Manna Isle Ohio, request for preliminary site plan approval for a new two-story Encore Medical Center to be located at PPN 742-17-047, Chagrin Boulevard and Richmond Road with the following stipulations: 1) Permission to landbank 187 parking spaces until such time as it is determined by either the applicant or the Building Commissioner that said parking spaces are required to adequately service the use, at which time the spaces shall be installed in accordance with the final site plan as directed and approved by the Building Commissioner and City Engineer; 2) Submission with the final site development plan of cross access and parking agreements acceptable to the Law Department; and 3) Compliance with the comments and recommendations of the City Engineer.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Mann, J. Pasch, B. Zabell
	NAYS:	None
MOTION APPROVED		

P&Z 2017-12	JAMES HELLER, CONSULTANT, ON BEHALF OF KA, INC., IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN APPROVAL FOR TENANT EXPANSION AND SHARED PARKING AT 2101 RICHMOND ROAD, LA PLACE SHOPPING CENTER.
-------------	---

Mr. James Heller, Consultant, on behalf of KA, Inc., was present to request preliminary site plan approval for tenant expansion and shared parking at 2101 Richmond Road, La Place Shopping Center. They are requesting approval for two (2) small additions to the existing building. There is a proposed expansion of approximately 1,200 square feet of the northeast corner of the existing building which removes seven (7) parking spaces and the expansion, at this point, does remove two (2) spaces which has been taken into full account. Mr. Heller proceeded to discuss the details of the project.

Mr. Griswold stated there are no comments from Building or Fire Department.

Mr. Ciuni stated no Engineering comments at this time.

Mr. Smerigan stated this request is for preliminary site plan approval for tenant expansions and use of shared parking. The applicant is proposing two (2) building expansions that total approximately 1,540 square feet. The subject site is zoned U-4A Integrated Business District and the proposed additions would bring the total amount of tenant space to 100,966 square feet. The intent of the additions and renovations is to provide for more restaurant space. The relatively small additions have no impacts on either the building ground coverage requirement or any of the required building setbacks. The additional building area and the conversion of tenant space from retail to restaurant will, however, impact required parking.

Unlike the overall parking standard employed in the Shopping Center District, the parking requirement in the U-4A Integrated Business District is based upon the combination of the parking standards for each individual tenant. The applicant has provided a detailed breakdown of tenants by parking category. Based upon the proposed tenant mix, (which includes retail stores, services, offices, medical offices, restaurants, and a bank), the subject site is required by the Zoning Code to have a total of 790 parking spaces. The subject site has 393 surface parking spaces and 156 garage spaces for a total of 549 spaces. La Place was previously granted parking variances totaling 149 spaces, which makes the effective parking 698 spaces. That leaves a shortage of 92 spaces.

Pursuant to Section 1121.04, the applicant is proposing to share parking with the adjacent Beachwood Place Mall, which is under common ownership and has parking that exceeds the Zoning Code requirement. The applicant has provided a lease agreement for use of 92 parking spaces on the Beachwood Mall site. Section 1121.04 gives the Planning and Zoning Commission final authority to approve shared parking arrangements where there are legal agreements for access, use, and maintenance that are approved by the Law Department.

Preliminary site plan approval is recommended subject to the following:

1. Approval of a shared parking plan for 92 parking spaces, subject to approval of the legal agreements for access, use, and maintenance by the Law Department.
2. Any comments or recommendations of the City Engineer.

Mr. Pasch asked if the mall will still have a surplus of parking after the proposed buildout of the mall expansion.

Mr. Smerigan replied, yes, the surplus of parking at Beachwood Place is based on total buildout of both addition of mall and freestanding restaurant spaces.

Mr. Heller explained why there is excess parking at Beachwood Place.

Mr. Zabell stated there is already a parking variance existing today at La Place and asked every time a space changes we have to go back, recalculate parking and revisit this issue.

Mr. Smerigan replied yes, we would evaluate it every time a use changed. The problem typically occurs when we go from retail to restaurant because the restaurant parking requirement is significantly higher.

A discussion ensued.

Mr. Heller informed the Commission the garage is being painted totally white which will brighten up the total garage along with new LED lighting. The intent is to come in with a new sign for the garage to help it make it more visible and some wayfinding signs to get to that garage because there are 156 spaces there and a new vestibule going in that will connect the garage into the lower level of the mall.

Mr. Zabell asked if the mall has an active valet parking program.

Mr. Benjamin Freeman, General Growth Properties, replied no they do not have an active valet program as those are more restaurateur programs. Historically they have not seen the need for one. It is something they can monitor and have throughout their portfolio. If it becomes an issue or a request, they work very closely with their tenants to provide space and make that realty.

Mr. Zabell stated from his perspective he thinks that is how you address the potential parking issue they have. He does not have an objection to the shared parking arrangement but does not think anyone will walk across the parking lot to the proposed shared parking.

A discussion ensued.

A motion was made by B. Mann and seconded by C. Cohen to approve James Heller, Consultant, on behalf of KA, Inc., request for preliminary site plan approval for tenant expansion and shared parking at 2101 Richmond Road, La Place Shopping Center subject to the following stipulations: 1) Approval of a shared parking plan for 92 parking spaces, subject to approval of the legal agreements for access, use, and maintenance by the Law Department; and 2) Any comments or recommendations of the City Engineer.

ROLL CALL: AYES: C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Mann,
J. Pasch, B. Zabell
NAYS: None
MOTION APPROVED

P&Z 2017-13

BRUCE W. BISBANO, BISBANO & ASSOCIATES, INC., ON BEHALF OF THE PASSOV GROUP, IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY AND FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL FOR PROPOSED REMOTE ATM LOCATION WITHIN EXISTING PARKING LOT AT 3401 RICHMOND ROAD, CITIZENS BANK.

Mr. Bruce W. Bisbano, Bisbano & Associates, Inc., on behalf on the Passov Group and Citizens Bank, was present to request preliminary and final site plan approval for proposed remote ATM location within the existing parking lot at 3401 Richmond Road, Citizens Bank. The proposed change of ATM location would improve traffic flow on the parking lot. They would lose a few parking spaces with this structure. It is a standalone concrete pad with a remote ATM and a prefabricated canopy with the signage.

Mr. Griswold stated Fire Department has no issues and would note proposed signage for the ATM would require the building owner's approval prior to them coming to Architectural Board of Review.

Mr. Ciuni stated he likes this idea, it is better circulation, have no issues with this project and recommend approval.

Mr. Smerigan stated this request is for both preliminary and final site plan approval to relocate the ATM machine for Citizens Bank from the rear wall of the existing building to a remote location in the parking lot. The ATM machine would be placed on an island in the rear parking lot. The machine would be protected from vehicle damage by bollards. The relocation of the ATM machine will improve traffic flow on the subject site and eliminate some safety issues with pedestrians entering and exiting the building. Approval is also recommended.

A motion was made by B. Zabell and seconded by B. Mann to approve Bruce W. Bisbano, Bisbano & Associates, Inc., on behalf on the Passov Group, request for preliminary and final site plan approval for proposed remote ATM location within the existing parking lot at 3401 Richmond Road, Citizens Bank subject to the comments of the Building Department.

ROLL CALL: AYES: C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Mann,
J. Pasch, B. Zabell
NAYS: None
MOTION APPROVED

P&Z 2017-14 MARK FREMONT, ARCHITECT, ON BEHALF OF EQUITY BEACHWOOD, IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY AND FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL FOR EXTENSION OF DRIVEWAY THROUGH TO ENTERPRISE PARKWAY ADDITIONAL PPN 742-20-002, 3355-65 RICHMOND ROAD.

Mr. Mark Fremont, Architect, on behalf of Equity Beachwood, was present to request preliminary and final site plan approval for extension of driveway through to Enterprise Parkway additional PPN 742-20-002, 3355-65 Richmond Road. He stated it will not be called Corporate Park Drive anymore.

Mr. Griswold stated there are no comments from Building and Fire Department at this time.

Mr. Ciuni stated it is a good project but cannot be a final approval. He needs full civil drawings especially of the new parking areas. He recommends preliminary approval at this time.

Mr. Smerigan stated he is anticipating only preliminary site plan approval to extend the existing Corporate Park Drive to Enterprise Parkway. The new driveway access would permit access to the Corporate Park development from Enterprise Parkway. Currently the subject site can only be accessed from Richmond Road. This connection is similar to the proposal the City made to connect Richmond Road and Enterprise Parkway with a private street; however, the current proposal would simply be a private drive access to the commercial property. In order to access the Enterprise Parkway right-of-way, the applicant will need to cross a narrow strip of City owned land.

Because of the grade change between Corporate Park and Enterprise Drive, it will be necessary to construct some retaining walls. As a result approximately 11 parking spaces would be removed. As part of the improvements the applicant is proposing to install 25 new parking spaces on the north side of Corporate Park Drive. The application also includes the construction of 30 new parking spaces between the front of the northern building and the Richmond Road right-of-way. Four spaces would be removed to provide the access to the new spaces. The overall result would be a net gain of 40 parking spaces. Those spaces would be closer to west end of the property where parking demand has been higher. Full access from Enterprise Parkway could reduce some of the difficult left turning movements by vehicles currently accessing the site from southbound Richmond Road.

In summary, the proposed driveway should enhance traffic flow in the area and the increased accessibility should improve the overall desirability of the site for new commercial uses. Final site plan approval would require an access easement agreement with the City to cross the strip of City owned land adjacent to the Enterprise Parkway right-of-way. Similar access easements were executed with DDR and Penske for driveways across the City property to the right-of-way. The additional parking is also an enhancement to the functionality of the subject site, particularly given that the new parking is at the western end of the site.

Preliminary site plan approval is recommended subject to the following:

1. Approval of an access easement acceptable to the Law Department by City Council prior to final site plan submission.
2. Any comments or recommendations of the City Engineer.

Mr. Cohen asked is the parkway privately owned.

Mr. Fremont replied yes.

Mr. Smerigan replied it will be privately owned and maintained.

Mr. Cohen asked how you anticipate people getting to the sidewalk across the landscaping from the parking alongside the roadway.

Mr. Fremont stated he has altered the site plan since submitted to the Commission and actually eliminated that sidewalk. The landscape will remain landscape as it is now and will improve it.

Mayor Gorden commented he knows the City plan has been abandoned but are some of those improvements discussed at that time such as lighting and things on Richmond Road that were being considered, going to be put into this plan as some of those became safety issues.

Ms. Bonnie Reinberg, Equity Beachwood, replied the lighting was being changed because the sidewalks were going in because it was a City street. She has existing lighting now all down the driveway.

Mr. Fremont stated in the next phase of the project which will have to do with facades of the buildings and rebranding of the whole project, he and Bonnie have discussed improving the lighting more towards where the buildings are for the tenants there. She would like to at this point use the same lighting that is there. There is significant lighting there now and probably meets all your codes.

Mayor Gorden commented the only thing they are looking at now is the curb cut, access to Corporate Park and the additional parking. He asked is there a second curb cut on the property.

Mr. Fremont replied those are existing curb cuts and the other areas marked are resurfacing of existing.

Mayor Gorden asked if anyone in the Police Department have reviewed for any safety issues.

Mr. Griswold stated the Police Department did not respond relative to any comments. This being preliminary and addressing increased parking and curb cut, there is a lot of information that will need to be provided prior to final approval. For example, Engineering, the lot parallel to Richmond Road will probably require retaining walls. They are confident the applicant will provide that.

Mr. Zabell asked if the proposed curb is full access or right-in, right-out.

Mr. Smerigan replied it is full access.

Chairman Hecht asked if there is a name for it.

Mr. Fremont replied they are searching for a name.

Mr. Reinberg commented does she need a name, it is her driveway and is not sure if she is renaming it.

Mr. Smerigan stated essentially it is a driveway and serves a fairly significant project.

A motion was made by B. Mann and seconded by B. Zabell to approve Mark Fremont, Architect, on behalf of Equity Beachwood, request for preliminary site plan approval for extension of driveway through to Enterprise Parkway additional PPN 742-20-002, 3355-65 Richmond Road with the following stipulations: 1) Approval of an access easement acceptable to the Law Department by City Council prior to final site plan submission; and 2) Any comments or recommendations of the City Engineer.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Mann, J. Pasch, B. Zabell
	NAYS:	None
	MOTION APPROVED - RECOMMENDATION TO COUNCIL – Monday, May 15, 2017 at 7:00 PM	

Mr. Mann asked is there a reason why Mooney is still on pending and can it be removed from pending.

Mr. Griswold stated they should leave Mooney on pending.

A motion was made by B. Mann and seconded by C. J. Pasch to adjourn the meeting.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Mann, J. Pasch, B. Zabell
	NAYS:	None
	MEETING ADJOURNED	

Rochelle Hecht, Chairman

Veronica Muth, Secretary

Whitney Crook, Clerk of Council