BEACHWOOD CITY COUNCIL MINUTES COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING HELD AT BEACHWOOD CITY HALL, COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 25325 FAIRMOUNT BOULEVARD, ON MONDAY, AUGUST 29, 2016 AT 5:30 P.M.

The meeting was called to order at 5:30 P.M. by Acting Council President Melvin M. Jacobs.

ROLL CALL:	Present:	J. Berns, A. Isaacson, M.M. Jacobs, B.B. Janovitz, B. Linick, J. Pasch
	Absent:	M.S. Horwitz,
	Also Present:	Mayor Gorden, H.L. Jones, P. Kearns, Firefighter P. Corpora, Firefighter G. Liggett, Rob Franklin and Paul Erickson from Lemay, Erickson, Willcox

1. Discussion regarding proposed Fire Station #2.

The meeting was opened with a presentation from Lemay, Erickson, and Wilcox. This presentation is included in these minutes for the official record.

After the presentation, Chief Kearns made comments regarding this project and the work that Lemay, Erickson, Wilcox has put into this concept.

Chief Kearns stated that this project is now at a point where decisions need to be made. The City has the permits in hand for the land and with ninety five percent of the plans completed; we are at a budget of 8.3 million dollars.

Chief Kearns stated that 1.5 million dollars has been removed through value engineering. Some of that value engineering included removing ceramic tile and replacing it with carpet, reduce the footage of the tile in the showers, and reducing the number of light fixtures outside.

Mr. Franklin from Lemay, Erickson, and Wilcox described some of the key components of this proposed building. Those components discussed included public entrances off of Richmond Road, training components, landscape, architectural features, and staggered bays.

Chief Kearns stated that at this time, he wanted to present an alternate design concept. This alternate design concept included removing the Police function and downsizing the training room.

Chief Kearns stated that the reduction of the training room did significantly change the operation.

Mr. Franklin stated the estimated costs to create a design comparison included a design with 3800 square feet less than the original floor plan. That cost would be $8,036,998.00 plus $400,000.00 for the additional design cost for a total of $8,436,998.

Mr. Franklin stated that cost would be $301.32 per square foot for the alternative design concept that was discussed.

Chief Kearns stated that the estimated cost would be 8.3 million dollars for the original design concept and 8.4 million dollars for the alternative design concept.

Chief Kearns stated that the site work costs were a bit more expensive than expected because of the larger than anticipated Wetland.

Chief Kearns stated that the land and the site cost will come in under 1.4 million dollars.

Chief Kearns stated that this cost is $200,000.00 less than expected

Chief Kearns stated that the next step in this meeting is to answer questions and then get a final recommendation to Council from the administrative side.

Chief Kearns stated that he cannot know the firm cost of this project until it goes to bid.

At this time, the floor was opened to questions from City Council.

Mr. Linick stated that at the time, he had no question but he wanted to express his appreciation for all of the work that has been put into this project currently.

Ms. Janovitz asked if the smaller design is chosen, will ongoing costs be reduced.

Chief Kearns stated that the largest ongoing cost at this time is electricity.

Chief Kearns stated he would like to make all of the lighting LED. It is understood that this is an expensive cost upfront but it would have a two year return on investment.

Chief Kearns stated that the current design concept presented has negligible heating costs.

Mr. Pasch stated that he did not have many questions about a smaller building that will cost more.

Mr. Pasch stated that he would have like to have seen the other design concepts in the beginning.

Mr. Pasch asked if cuts were made to materially alter the function of the space.

Chief Kearns replied that the design concept presented kept the building functional to lower costs.

Chief Kearns stated that although the tile being replaced with carpeting did cut down on the initial cost it will not keep the costs low over time. Carpeting will need to be replaced every ten or fifteen years.

Chief Kearns also stated that removing the radiant flooring cut down on costs however, it would be beneficial to add it back in because having the radiant flooring will dry the trucks thereby cutting down on rust and keep the trucks in better condition for a longer time.

Chief Kearns stated that $22,000.00 in savings does not affect the firefighters doing their job and ultimately the goal is to save money in the long run.

Mr. Pasch asked if costs are being deferred over an amount of time.

Chief Kearns stated that money will be spent eventually over time.

Chief Kearns stated that adding the radiant flooring back into the design concept is a "no brainer."

Chief Kearns stated that he would possibly like to add the radiant flooring as a bid alternate.

Mr. Pasch asked if there was an option to get a less expensive fire pole.

Chief Kearns stated that in regard to the pole, there are two classifications. One classification is a non-rated device; the other is a rated device.

Chief Kearns stated that a non-rated device is defined as non-rated for fire use.

Chief Kearns stated that a rated pole has a different design and part of the high price is the closure device that seals off the exhaust from the bays getting into the living quarters.

Mr. Pasch asked if the current pictures presented represent the value engineering.

Chief Kearns stated that some of the value engineering is reflected in the presented pictures. The lower number of lights is visible, the reduced landscaping and reduced trees are also visible.

Chief Kearns stated that the architect did include forty outside LED lights in the estimate.

Mr. Isaacson expressed his wished of having an alternate option in the beginning of this project.

Mr. Isaacson observed that none of the value engineering will affect the Fire Department or the residents.

Mr. Franklin stated that a curtain wall would be stronger but the storefront windows that were added to accommodate anything higher than twelve feet.

Mr. Isaacson asked if not covering the floor in epoxy will shorten the life of the floor.

Chief Kearns stated that the epoxy is easier to clean and nicer to look at.

Mr. Franklin stated that epoxy is slip resistant and the radiant heat will help the floor dry a bit quicker.

At this time, Chief Kearns stated that he wanted to mention that through value engineering, the sound wall was shortened by three feet.

Chief Kearns also wanted to address the controversy over the glass in the building.

Chief Kearns stated that there are definite savings for natural light and can create a balance between natural light, cooling, and severe weather.

Chief Kearns stated that if the windows blow out then safety can be jeopardized.

Chief Kearns stated that certain training could be done on site that could save money in the long run.

Mr. Isaacson asked if shortening the wall will affect the neighbors.

Chief Kearns stated that some training would be visible to neighbors with the shortened wall and is concerned that neighbors may be upset.

Mr. Franklin stated that the fire station would be more visible but the sound is negligible.

Mr. Isaacson asked if the life of the building has been shortened through this value engineering.

Mr. Franklin replied "no."

Mr. Isaacson asked if changing the wall size is more aesthetic then having an impact on the community.

Mr. Franklin replied that changing the wall size would be more for visual aspect.

Mr. Isaacson asked if lowering the hose tower by three feet would be a problem.

Chief Kearns stated that the roof is functionally at the same height as before and there was a parapet for training and that parapet was removed to save money.

Chief Kearns stated that he will not argue over having three feet of parapet removed.

Mr. Jacobs stated that the land was bought a long time ago for the purpose of putting a Fire Station on it. It is a shame that the land and permits cost so much.

Mr. Jacobs asked if the permits were obtained earlier would it have cost less money.

Chief Kearns stated that over the years, the federal regulations have changed twice and wound up costing more money. Chief Kearns stated that the land is losing a minimum of four to five percent per year.

Chief Kearns stated that three years ago, the project cost was at 1.3 million to 1.4 million less than where we are today.

Mr. Franklin stated that delaying the project adds more money each year.

Chief Kearns stated that three years ago, the project would have been 6 to 8 million dollars and currently, leaving out the land the construction alone is 6.9 million dollars.

Mr. Jacobs asked if putting the dispatch center in the Police area would be feasible.

Chief Kearns stated that the current 880 square feet that is currently the Police area in the design is not large enough for the Dispatch Center. Some rework would need to be done if City Council wanted to discuss that.

Mr. Jacobs asked if it was possible to put the Dispatch Center in the proposed Fire Station.

Chief Kearns stated anything is possible.

Chief Kearns in reply to Mr. Jacobs stated that a safety center which would be a combination of Police and Fire could go into the proposed Fire Station but Chief Kearns also stated that he is neutral on that matter. He has no preference one way or the other.

Mr. Jacobs is concerned about the carpeting being installed rather than the tile.

Mr. Jacobs stated that he is afraid that the carpet may need to be replace faster than ten years and Mr. Jacobs doesn't think saving a few dollars today will be a benefit if the carpet will need to be replace in five years.

Chief Kearns stated that this Fire Station is not just an office building.

Chief Kearns stated that Lemay, Erickson, and Willcox are experts in "Hot Zone" design.

Chief Kearns stated that the hazmat room and bay room will be the most contaminated and OSHA may not allow carpet in those areas for example.

Mr. Erickson stated that there has been a movement to try and reduce cancer rates in the firefighter community.

Mr. Erickson stated that these firefighter's are exposed to smoke that is laden with chemicals and carcinogens. Through education and fire station design, exposure is trying to be reduced on site and at the station. Fire Departments are becoming more aware of the risk of exposure to carcinogens.

Mr. Erickson is proposing to include a boot wash station as well as sinks and sanitizers.

Mr. Erickson also proposed vestibules in and out of the bays to create an air lock.

Chief Kearns stated that Workman's Compensation claims for cancer are automatic for firefighters.

Chief Kearns stated that the future is now and that is why certain safety features are built into the building.

Mr. Erickson stated that the fire stations that have been designed by Lemay, Erickson, and Willcox have struck a great balance and provided a source of pride for the City and residents in which they were built.

Mr. Berns stated that he would like to know the level of experience that Lemay, Erickson, and Willcox has with building fire stations.

Mr. Erickson replied that his firm has constructed more than 80 fire stations over more than 30 years.

Mr. Berns stated that he has looked at the value engineering and is concerned that the expense of having radiant flooring in the garage would outweigh the benefit.

Mr. Berns asked for some background information on Fire Station #1 that was opened in 2001.

Chief Kearns stated that in 2001, Fire Station #1 was 24,000 square feet and the cost was 4.8 million dollars.

Chief Kearns stated that the site work was not as expensive because the City had the land.

Mr. Berns inquired about the cost of a basement on the administrative side of the building.

Mr. Erickson stated that the cost would be significant.

Mr. Erickson also stated that the facility would need to be larger to include a dispatch center.

Mr. Berns pointed out that there was an error with the asphalt pricing and advised referring to the value engineering portion of the PowerPoint that is attached for the record.

Mr. Linick asked what about the final design was driven by the community.

Mr. Erickson replied that the proposed design was based on a contemporary, functional aesthetic which looked high-tech and modern.

Mr. Erickson stated that his firm took into consideration some of the other buildings in the City that did not look overtly modern, and chose to design a calm and sophisticated looking building.

Chief Kearns stated that the proposed design is durable, strong and serviceable and that the building would use more straight lines in construction because curves can get expensive.

Mr. Linick stated that he doesn't know if it's up to Council for design elements of the proposed building and that a few things to be considered are the affordability, necessity to community, and if it is an element that the fire station needs.

Mr. Linick stated that it is time to vote yes or no and he appreciates everyone's work that has gone into this project.

Mr. Pasch stated that Council still needs to decide which design will go to bid.

Mr. Linick stated that he will now be looking to the Mayor and the Fire Department to decide on if the value engineered concept or the original concept will go to bid.

Chief Kearns stated that he wanted Council to understand how far the value engineering went.

Chief Kearns stated that the value engineered station is "lean" compared to other stations across the country.

Chief Kearns stated that he has been given several directives by Council and one such directive was to prepare for regionalization.

Chief Kearns stated that in preparation for the potential of regionalization, this station would be a way to make sure Beachwood was in charge and this station would get the City through the future.

Mayor Gorden stated that for three years, the City has been looking at future need. Safety needs of the City were looked at as a whole and a recommendation to purchase the land was made to accommodate a new safety center or safety function.

Mayor Gorden stated that the land was purchased for a safety force use and fire station #1 will not support the continued needs of this community.

Mayor Gorden stated that all of the elements presented currently are to accommodate the needs of today and the needs of the future.

Mayor Gorden stated that things have changed for the Fire Department and that there are currently four rescue squads being operated.

Mayor Gorden's recommendation is the original design.

Mayor Gorden stated that as the Safety Director, his recommendation would be the original building concept and to add back in some of the items taken away through value engineering.

Mayor Gorden stated that this building will serve this community for years to come.

Mr. Pasch stated that it is abundantly clear that we can function out of the current fire station and Mr. Pasch also stated that the next obvious step is to go out to bid.

Chief Kearns stated that he is unwilling to take to sound wall out. Chief Kearns stated that he previously stood in front of Council and promised that all things would be done to reduce the noise.

Chief Kearns stated that the previous HVAC meeting went in a completely different direction than expected and the purpose of the current meeting was to inform Council of everything in this project.

Chief Kearns stated that he would like to add some of the items removed as bid alternates and he believes those items would be beneficial to the station at a lower cost.

Chief Kearns stated that the radiant flooring is negligible and the Fire Department would like to go with the first design.

Chief Kearns stated that he would like to be authorized to go to bid with a list of bid alternates. Chief Kearns also stated that it will be more expensive to build over the winter months and that construction would wait until the spring to begin.

Mr. Jacobs stated that this station should have been built many years ago and that certain elements of this project have nothing to do with Council.

Mr. Jacobs stated that the main concern of Council is the health and safety of the community and that we are lucky that we have to money to construct this new station.

Chief Kearns stated that he would like legislation to go to bid and then formally bid when the team feels it is the best time.

Chief Kearns also addressed the Indiana Bat situation.

Chief Kearns stated that the land needs to be cleared prior to March 31, 2017 or else the project will be waiting until the end of September 2017.

Chief Kearns stated that he will make a recommendation to the Mayor when to clear the land.

At this point there were no further items to discuss.

ADJOURNMENT

Moved by James Pasch, seconded by Justin Berns at 7:29 P.M. to adjourn the Committee of the Whole Meeting to the next regularly scheduled Council meeting.

ROLL CALL	Yes:	J. Berns, M.M. Jacobs, B.B. Janovitz, B.H. Linick, J. Pasch
	Abstain:	None.
	No:	None.
	Not Voting:	None.

MOTION ADOPTED

Approved:

Merle S. Gorden

Merle S. Gorden, Mayor

Whitney M. Crook

Whitney Crook, Clerk of Council