

Moved by M.M. Jacobs, seconded by M.Mintz, that the minutes of the Safety and Public Health Committee Meeting held on September 30, 2015 be approved.

MOTION ADOPTED

MOTION ADOPTED

MOTION ADOPTED

Mr. Mintz stated that the police were walking and patrolling the area and handing out glow sticks to the children. Mr. Mintz thanked Chief Winebrenner for a great job, as always.

COUNCILMEMBER REPORTS (NON-AGENDA ITEMS)(continued)

Mr. Isaacson stated that he had police in his driveway all night long and that was a good thing because he had a fair number of kids in his driveway all night long. Mr. Isaacson stated that officers were handing out glow sticks and that was a fantastic idea. Mr. Isaacson stated that he has been hearing a lot of comments about the Peter Max exhibit and everyone who attended mentioned how wonderful it was. Mr. Isaacson stated that it was a great amenity that the City offered to the residents.

Mr. Pasch stated that over the last several meetings in the comment section there has been potential legislative proposals that were made; 1) the potential to broadcast future meetings; and 2) a variety of gun safety legislation that Mr. Pasch would like to discuss and he would like to see the Communications Committee and Safety and Public Health Committee move forward on these issues.

Mr. Jacobs stated that since there will be new Council members he would advise waiting until 2016 to begin discussions.

Mr. Pasch stated that he does not think that we need to wait for a new Council to begin working on these issues.

Mr. Mintz stated that a Communications Committee meeting is scheduled for November 16, 2015.

Mayor Gorden stated that discussions will begin on November 16th.

DEPARTMENT DIRECTOR'S

Mrs. Carmen stated that Sunday, November 8th the City will be celebrating Veteran's Day at the Beachwood Cemetery beginning at 11:00 A.M. Mrs. Carmen stated that the ceremony is less than an hour and there will be approximately five people speaking and the Color Guard will be there.

Mrs. Carmen stated that although Entrovation is not until 2016, she would like to inform Council that this will be the ninth year for Entrovation and the City wanted to stage the event at City Hall but the schools are requesting a Saturday and the City has tried to work around that date but she could not make it work so the schools will be hosting Entrovation, for the first time, at Beachwood High School on Saturday, April 30th. Mrs. Carmen stated that one of the reasons the schools feel so strongly about hosting Entrovation on a Saturday is that the focus of Entrovation will be youth entrepreneurs.

Mayor Gorden stated that there was extensive discussion this morning and as recently as last week the City is able to offer the schools another day if they so choose.

CM 2015-320

CITIZEN'S REMARKS

1. Mr. Michael Silver
25495 Bryden Road
Beachwood, Ohio 44122

Mr. Silver wished Mr. Wachter and Mr. Horwitz the best of luck tomorrow for the elections and he feels really good that there are seven great candidates and four open seats and there are some that he likes better than others. Mr. Silver thanked Mr. Goodman and Mr. Mintz for all that they have done for the City and for being great leaders and they have inspired him in his efforts to run for election.

2. Mr. Steven Fox
25107 Hazelmere
Beachwood, Ohio 44122

Mr. Fox stated that he has noticed more people on their cell phones in Beachwood than there should be while driving. Mr. Fox stated that he thought people could be stopped if they are driving with their cell phones in their hands. Mr. Fox stated that he was almost rear-ended twice this past week and he thinks that it is still a problem.

Mr. Fox stated that the Service Department went above and beyond for him because he had to replace his door and it was not his garbage day but he called the Service Department at 11:00 A.M. and by 1:00 P.M. the door was gone.

FINANCE AND INSURANCE COMMITTEE

1. Submitted to Council an Ordinance for the payment of Certain Claims (Bills).

ORDINANCE NO. 2015-150 – Introduced by Mark I. Wachter
AN ORDINANCE FOR THE PAYMENT OF CERTAIN BILLS (BILLS)

Moved by M.I. Wachter, seconded by J. Pasch, that Ordinance No. 2015-150 be placed on first reading.

ROLL CALL	Yes:	F.S. Goodman, M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson, M.M. Jacobs, M. Mintz, J. Pasch, M.I. Wachter
	Abstain:	None.
	No:	None.
	Not Voting:	None.
		MOTION ADOPTED-RULES SUSPENDED

Moved by M.I. Wachter, seconded by J. Pasch, that Ordinance No. 2015-150 be adopted.

ROLL CALL	Yes:	F.S. Goodman, M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson, M.M. Jacobs, M. Mintz, J. Pasch, M.I. Wachter
	Abstain:	None.
	No:	None.

FINANCE AND INSURANCE COMMITTEE(continued)

Not Voting: None.
MOTION ADOPTED

2. Submitted to Council an Ordinance accepting the bid of Trident/Argonaut Insurance Company through McGowan Governmental Underwriters for the 2015-2016 General Liability Insurance for the City of Beachwood; and declaring this to be an urgent measure.

ORDINANCE NO. 2015-151 – Introduced by Alec Isaacson
AN ORDINANCE ACCEPTING THE BID OF TRIDENT/ARGONAUT
INSURANCE COMPANY THROUGH MCGOWAN GOVERNMENTAL
UNDERWRITERS FOR THE 2015-2016 GENERAL LIABILITY INSURANCE
FOR THE CITY OF BEACHWOOD; AND DECLARING THIS TO BE AN
URGENT MEASURE

Moved by A. Isaacson, seconded by M. Mintz, that Ordinance No. 2015-151 be placed on first reading.

ROLL CALL	Yes:	F.S. Goodman, M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson, M.M. Jacobs, M. Mintz, J. Pasch, M.I. Wachter
	Abstain:	None.
	No:	None.
	Not Voting:	None.

MOTION ADOPTED-RULES SUSPENDED

Moved by A. Isaacson, seconded by M. Mintz, that Ordinance No. 2015-151 be adopted.

ROLL CALL	Yes:	F.S. Goodman, M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson, M.M. Jacobs, M. Mintz, J. Pasch, M.I. Wachter
	Abstain:	None.
	No:	None.
	Not Voting:	None.

MOTION ADOPTED

3. Submitted to Council an Ordinance amending BCO Chapter 193 titled “Municipal Income Tax” in its entirety; and declaring this to be an urgent measure.

ORDINANCE NO. 2015-152 – Introduced by James Pasch
AN ORDINANCE AMENDING BCO CHAPTER 193 TITLED
“MUNICIPAL INCOME TAX IN ITS ENTIRETY; AND DECLARING
THIS TO BE AN URGENT MEASURE

Moved by J. Pasch, seconded by M.I. Wachter, that Ordinance No. 2015-152 be placed on first reading.

CM 2015-321

FINANCE AND INSURANCE COMMITTEE(continued)

ROLL CALL	Yes:	F.S. Goodman, M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson, M.M. Jacobs, M. Mintz, J. Pasch, M.I. Wachter
	Abstain:	None.
	No:	None.
	Not Voting:	None.

MOTION ADOPTED

RECREATION AND COMMUNITY SERVICES COMMITTEE

1. Submitted to Council an Ordinance authorizing the Mayor to enter into a Contract with Sliderenu for the Water Slide Restoration Project at the Beachwood Family Aquatic Center; and declaring this to be an urgent measure.

ORDINANCE NO. 2015-153 – Introduced by Mark Mintz
AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO A
CONTRACT WITH SLIDERENU FOR THE WATER SLIDE RESTORATION
PROJECT AT THE BEACHWOOD FAMILY AQUATIC CENTER; AND
DECLARING THIS TO BE AN URGENT MEASURE

Mr. Jacobs asked Mrs. Carmen about the warranty on the water slide restoration.

Mrs. Carmen stated that she would obtain that information and pass that information on to Council.

Moved by M. Mintz, seconded by A. Isaacson, that Ordinance No. 2015-153 be placed on first reading.

ROLL CALL	Yes:	F.S. Goodman, M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson, M.M. Jacobs, M. Mintz, J. Pasch, M.I. Wachter
	Abstain:	None.
	No:	None.
	Not Voting:	None.

MOTION ADOPTED

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

1. Submitted to Council an Ordinance approving current replacement pages to the Beachwood Codified Ordinances; and declaring this to be an urgent measure.

ORDINANCE NO. 2015-147 – Introduced by James Pasch
AN ORDINANCE APPROVING CURRENT REPLACEMENT PAGES TO
THE BEACHWOOD CODIFIED ORDINANCES; AND DECLARING THIS
TO BE AN URGENT MEASURE

Moved by J. Pasch, seconded by M.I. Wachter, that Ordinance No. 2015-147 be placed on first reading.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE(continued)

ROLL CALL	Yes:	F.S. Goodman, M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson, M.M. Jacobs, M. Mintz, J. Pasch, M.I. Wachter
	Abstain:	None.
	No:	None.
	Not Voting:	None.
		MOTION ADOPTED-RULES SUSPENDED

Moved by J. Pasch, seconded by M.I. Wachter, that Ordinance No. 2015-147 be adopted.

ROLL CALL	Yes:	F.S. Goodman, M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson, M.M. Jacobs, M. Mintz, J. Pasch, M.I. Wachter
	Abstain:	None.
	No:	None.
	Not Voting:	None.
		MOTION ADOPTED

SAFETY AND PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE

1. Submitted to Council an Ordinance authorizing the Mayor to enter into a Contract with GPD Group for design services for the Dispatch Center Renovation; and declaring this to be an urgent measure.

ORDINANCE NO. 2015-126 – Introduced by Melvin M. Jacobs
AN ORDINANCE AUTHORIZING THE MAYOR TO ENTER INTO A
CONTRACT WITH GPD GROUP FOR DESIGN SERVICES FOR THE
DISPATCH CENTER RENOVATION; AND DECLARING THIS TO BE
AN URGENT MEASURE

Placed on First Reading on: September 8, 2015
Placed on Second Reading on: September 21, 2015
Remain on Second Reading on: October 5, 2015
Remain on Second Reading on: October 19, 2015
Placed on Third and Final Reading on: November 2, 2015
Adopted on: November 2, 2015

Mr. Goodman stated that he would like Chief Winebrenner to present information regarding numbers and to also comment on the information that Officer Grein's wife is a dispatcher.

Chief Winebrenner stated that Officer Grein began his career with the City of Beachwood 13 years ago and approximately seven years ago he began to upgrade the technology and the Police Departments technological capabilities on a part-time basis in addition to his Patrolmen duties. Chief Winebrenner stated that over the last several years it has become very time consuming for Officer Grein and he now has taken on the IT responsibilities on a full-time basis. Chief Winebrenner stated that Officer Grein has no supervisory responsibilities and he is not in a position to make decisions for the Police Department. Chief Winebrenner stated that Officer Grein reports directly to him and anything Officer Grein proposes must be approved.

SAFETY AND PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE(continued)

Chief Winebrenner stated that Officer Grein's wife has been with the Beachwood Police Department for 20 years and approximately five and a half years ago they were married.

Chief Winebrenner stated that the overall preliminary estimated cost for this project is \$1,354,000.00. Chief Winebrenner stated that we will not know the exact cost of the project until detailed building plans and associated bidding documents are prepared and bids are submitted. Chief Winebrenner stated that out of that estimated total \$465,000.00 is earmarked for non-dispatch expenses such as a new jail board, roof repairs, building a female locker room and building a space for storage, records equipment and chemicals that are currently being stored in a place in the police garage. Chief Winebrenner stated that if you subtract the \$465,000.00 from the estimated cost of \$1,354,000.00, it leaves \$889,000.00 that the City would be spending to upgrade and build out the Dispatch Center. Chief Winebrenner stated that he has obtained an estimated cost of joining a regional dispatch center and that cost was approximately \$300,000 to buy-in to the regional dispatch center and approximately \$800,000.00 annual operating costs. Chief Winebrenner stated that if you subtract the \$300,000.00 cost to buy-in to a regional dispatch center from the \$889,000.00 that it would cost the City to upgrade the dispatch center, the City would be spending \$589,000.00 more to upgrade and maintain the City's dispatch center.

Chief Winebrenner stated that in addition, a number of larger agencies and those dispatched by regional dispatch centers operate on a 700-800 megahertz trunked system. The City's Police and Fire Departments along with the Pepper Pike Police Department operate on a 400 system. Chief Winebrenner stated that he would have some challenges staying on their current system and the City currently owns the radios and pays no monthly service charge. Chief Winebrenner stated that the City paid approximately \$900.00 per portable radio and \$700.00 per car radio. Chief Winebrenner stated that a 700-800 cable radio is more than \$3,000.00 each and in the case of Ohio Marks their monthly service charge is \$20.00 per radio. Chief Winebrenner stated that he was recently told that the \$20.00 monthly service charge might have been reduced to \$10.00 but he was unable to confirm that information before this evening.

Mr. Goodman asked Chief Winebrenner if that was a monthly usage fee per radio.

Chief Winebrenner responded yes. Chief Winebrenner stated that he would need approximately 100 radios for the Police and Fire Departments at an estimated cost of \$300,000.00 to replace all the radios plus an estimated annual service fee of \$24,000.00 if the cost is \$20.00 per month or \$12,000.00 at \$10.00 per month. This could further reduce the \$589,000.00 by \$300,000.00 for a total of \$289,000.00. Chief Winebrenner stated that they currently pay approximately \$1.2 million for dispatch. The City of Pepper Pike pays \$240,000.00 per year to the City to reduce the costs to approximately \$960,000.00. Chief Winebrenner stated that by using the annual estimated cost of \$800,000.00 for a regional dispatch center, the City would save \$160,000.00.

Chief Winebrenner stated that the City's Dispatchers perform record room and clerk duties that would not be done by a regional dispatch center. Chief Winebrenner stated that the Police Department would need to hire two more additional record clerks to do the paperwork and the court filings currently being performed by the dispatchers. Chief Winebrenner stated that this includes

SAFETY AND PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE(continued)

data entry for Mayor's Court and the Shaker Heights Municipal Court, expungements, records requests, walk-in reports, ticket paying, matron duties and a list of other duties. Chief Winebrenner stated that by using the estimated annual salary and benefits of a dispatcher, \$75,000.00 times two, he would need to spend \$150,000.00 for two additional people. Chief Winebrenner stated that he subtracted that from the \$160,000.00 we would be saving and that leaves an estimated cost he would be spending of \$10,000.00.

Chief Winebrenner stated that, in conclusion, by upgrading and maintaining the City's own dispatching services and assuring that the level of service to the community remains at a high level, the City will be spending approximately \$289,000.00 for upgrades at \$10,000.00 more for personnel than if we joined a regional dispatch center.

Chief Winebrenner stated that his responsibilities as Police Chief and Chief Kearns's responsibility as Fire Chief is to ensure that the community is provided with the best police and fire services as possible. An important element in providing those services is the City's dispatchers who provide the initial point of contact on every call, whether it is someone calling 911 for an emergency or someone calling to simply ask a question. The importance of quality dispatch services cannot be overstated. Chief Winebrenner stated that from the time of the initial call, the dispatchers are responsible for obtaining the proper information to ascertain the number and type of emergency personnel that are needed and where they are needed. Once the emergency personnel are on scene, dispatchers are responsible for keeping track of everyone, relaying information, calling additional resources if needed, and making sure all of that information is recorded in the RMS.

Chief Winebrenner stated that while all this is going on, other calls are coming in and Police and Fire personnel are calling in on their portable radios and requesting additional resources and information and the dispatchers are trying to accurately record all this information.

Chief Winebrenner stated that every community is unique and the needs and expectations of every community vary. The leaders of every community decide whether a regional dispatch center is the best choice for them based on those needs and expectations. Chief Winebrenner stated that he is deeply dedicated to doing what is best for serving the residents and providing the safest conditions possible for the Police and Fire personnel. Chief Winebrenner stated that in his opinion, the best decision is maintaining the City's own dispatch center.

Mr. Goodman asked Chief Winebrenner if it was \$20.00 per unit per month because as of right now that cost is not clear.

Chief Winebrenner stated that he was told today it possibly was reduced to \$10.00 per unit.

Mr. Pasch stated that in the \$300,000.00 that the City would have to pay to changeover the City's radios if we join a regional dispatch center and if down the road we create our own dispatch center, would the City have to upgrade the radio system to the Marks system that is being used at regional dispatch.

SAFETY AND PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE(continued)

Chief Winebrenner stated they he prefers the 400 platform.

Mr. Pasch asked Chief Winebrenner why and what are the differences.

Chief Winebrenner stated that the benefits of a Marks system radio does not outweigh the costs. Chief Winebrenner stated that there are issues with Marks radios penetrating through buildings.

Mr. Pasch asked Chief Winebrenner if there was an issue with different radios in the surrounding communities and how the cities communicate in an emergency.

Chief Winebrenner stated that the City can communicate with adjoining agencies on the City's radios.

Mr. Pasch stated that the estimate of \$300,000.00 that is currently being used for regional dispatch buy-in plus the \$800,000.00 annual cost is not a proposal but just an estimate that the City obtained.

Chief Winebrenner stated that they did not submit a formal proposal for a price.

Mr. Jacobs stated that he is a strong supporter for in-house dispatching and he has been Chairman of the Safety and Public Health Committee for years and he was also a part-time firefighter for 22 years. Mr. Jacobs stated for the safety and health of the community it is the right move to keep dispatch in-house. Mr. Jacobs stated that he has a question for both Chiefs', cities are moving towards regional dispatch such as Chagrin Valley or Bedford and in the past Beachwood has had mutual aid with other communities such as Shaker and University Heights for both police and fire and how would regionalism affect the City calling in Shaker Heights or a surrounding community for mutual aid.

Chief Winebrenner stated that the City does it now and it has no adverse effect whether the City keeps dispatch in-house or moves towards a regional dispatch center.

Chief Kearns stated that the Fire calls in mutual aid more than police. Chief Kearns stated that he prefers in-house dispatchers. Chief Kearns stated that it is much easier for the City dispatchers to talk-in help from other communities and guide them in and this happens quite often.

Mr. Isaacson asked Chief Winebrenner to walk him through how they arrived at the \$800,000.00 per year cost estimate.

Chief Winebrenner stated that he asked Officer Grein to call a regional dispatch center and to obtain an estimate as to what it would cost to join a regional dispatch center.

Mr. Isaacson stated that he understand that centers like that bill per call and when you look at the number of calls that he came up with the number differs quite substantially from \$800,000.00. Mr. Isaacson stated that he is trying to understand where he went wrong.

SAFETY AND PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE(continued)

Mr. Goodman stated that he thought Mr. Isaacson called the one center and that was the same number that they gave him as well.

Mr. Isaacson stated that they gave him an estimate and the \$800,000.00 estimate that he was given came from the call volume of another city and that city's call volume does not match our City call volumes.

Mr. Mintz stated that the City has two Chiefs' that have been here for many many years and we pay them a lot of money and they are the experts, we are not. Mr. Mintz stated that it is always better to control your own destiny. Mr. Mintz stated that the City's residents expect the best and the City has the best response times in the State if not in the Country. Mr. Mintz stated shame on us if we do not keep dispatch in-house to save a few dollars, and that is if we would even save any money at all. Mr. Mintz stated that his family has used the rescue services as well as hundreds of people and the City has received thousands of letters from residents stating how good our services are. Mr. Mintz stated that if Council is not going to listen to our professionals and the Chiefs who have been with the City for over 30 years, shame on us. Otherwise, why hire them, Mr. Mintz stated that Council is not safety professionals and residents expect the best. Mr. Mintz stated that for all those reasons he would not want our dispatch center anywhere else.

Mr. Goodman stated that this vote is to contract with GPD and if you are not in favor of it he understands and you could vote no right now. Mr. Goodman stated that the better scenario from his standpoint is that we will have some more confirmed numbers other than the estimates because all we have is what people are guess estimating in terms of construction costs and if the construction costs come in at three times of what the City's expectations are then we still have the ability to make a decision. Mr. Goodman stated that he would like to have a vote on this tonight.

Mr. Pasch stated that as much as it is important to get a firm cost and what it would cost to build the City's dispatch center can only be done by having a plan that is actually drawn out. Mr. Pasch stated that by the same token, he thinks it is as equally important to get a firm cost on what it would cost to join a regional dispatch center. Mr. Pasch stated that right now Council is working with fuzzy numbers at best because it is an estimate without a proposal that has been submitted to get an exact cost. Mr. Pasch stated that as we vote on this today and obtain an exact figure on what it would cost to build a regional dispatch center he suggests that we simultaneously still push for what it would cost to be in a regional dispatch center that way when the time comes to make a final decision that he, as a Councilman, has what he deems appropriate facts in front of him. Mr. Pasch stated that he realizes tonight we are not voting on authorizing a 1.4 million dollar dispatch center but he would like to move forward having both sets of numbers before him. Mr. Pasch stated that looking at what is presented now if the cost is \$290,000.00 to upgrade the dispatch center and a total of \$300,000.00 with staff and building the City's own dispatch center he would vote to keep it in-house at that price point. Mr. Pasch stated that as of right now he does not know if that is a definitive price point.

Mr. Isaacson stated that we do not have an apples-to-apples comparison of services. Mr. Isaacson stated that it is one thing if an organization is cheaper than the other but if it is cheaper and

SAFETY AND PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE(continued)

does not offer all the services the City requires than it is clear that we keep it in-house and we have not found that yet.

Mr. Mintz stated that he does not know why everyone does not want to listen to the Chiefs' with all their experience and he does not understand how all you guys think you have more experience than two men who have 60 years of experience and why would you want to take it out of the City. Mr. Mintz stated that he hopes they never have a problem if they go regional that you do not get the service that the residents have been receiving. Mr. Mintz suggested that maybe they read some of the letters from residents that the City has received over the years on their services.

Mr. Isaacson stated that he sees the letters and he agonizes over this.

Mr. Mintz stated that he disagrees with Mr. Isaacson.

Mr. Isaacson stated that there is a bit of a difference between a few dollars of savings.

Mr. Mintz stated that there is a big difference in the service and listening to your Chiefs who have experience. Mr. Mintz stated that Mr. Isaacson does not have the experience that the Chiefs have.

Mr. Goodman stated that there are differences of opinions on this subject.

Mr. Pasch stated to Mr. Mintz that having access to information when making your decision and saying you do not trust your advisors are two statements that do not line up with each other. Mr. Pasch stated that it is not that he would not wind up voting to keep it in-house, and it is not that he does not even want this specific proposal to go forward to obtain the drawings, but what he is saying is that by the time the final decision is made he would like to have the final numbers in front of him. Mr. Pasch stated that access to information does not mean that you doubt the people you are relying on for advice but what it does mean is that you are able to weigh everything before casting a vote. Mr. Pasch stated that he is trying to do his due diligence and a lot of that due diligence is listening to the Chief. Mr. Pasch stated that the other part of his due diligence is having facts and figures in front of him when he casts a vote.

Mayor Gorden stated that he would like give his perspective and it is up to City Council to make the final decision. Mayor Gorden stated that the process of looking at dispatching goes far back long before Chief Winebrenner took the position as Police Chief. Mayor Gorden stated that he and Chief Sechrist had been reviewing this over the last four years. Mayor Gorden stated that Chief Sechrist's recommendation from the beginning, and the Mayor concurs with Chief Sechrist and Chief Winebrenner, to keep dispatch in-house. Mayor Gorden stated that keeping in consideration everything that both Chiefs have stated, and having first-hand experience in the dispatch center himself, and the decisions that are being rendered by the dispatchers and the Police and Fire Departments is to the City's advantage for the City to control dispatch within the City of Beachwood. Mayor Gorden stated that he does not make that decision, Council does, but as Mayor and Safety Director he strongly suggests controlling the City's destiny. The Mayor stated that the City has strong leadership in Police and Fire and he strongly urges that Council follow their recommendation.

SAFETY AND PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE(continued)

Mr. Horwitz stated that he wanted to comment on Officer Grein. Mr. Horowitz stated that he has worked with him and truly believes he is the City's IT expert and he does not questions his evaluation of equipment and his knowledge along with the work he is doing on the fiber optic project on Richmond Road. Mr. Horwitz stated that Officer Grein has also given the City good information for the years that he has been on Council. Mr. Horwitz stated that it would have been appropriate for Council to know, and he thinks City Council found this out within the last few weeks or days, that his wife was an employee. Mr. Horwitz stated that he knows the decisions and recommendations come from the Chief and the Mayor but that kind of information in any kind of public body should always be full disclosure. Mr. Horwitz stated that it has nothing to do with the quality of Officer Grein, and he thinks he is an outstanding individual, but the City needs to have full disclosure on any kind of issue like this.

Mr. Horwitz stated that his concern is not doing this cheap and he resents the concept that some Council members are trying to do this cheap. Mr. Horwitz stated that the City of Beachwood is not an isolated island either and he does not know how many cities there are in this County but there is a movement to regionalize within Cuyahoga County and it is pretty much a mandate. Mr. Horwitz asked if there is a mandate by the year 2018, and if the City of Beachwood is not regionalized, than does the City not receive money from the 911 calls.

Chief Winebrenner stated that he had not heard of that mandate.

Mr. Horwitz stated that he had read something that had to do with the distribution of 911 tax money or the service charge on each phone account and that they were going to stop giving that to individual cities if they were not regionalized.

Chief Winebrenner stated that he thinks the County receives that.

Mr. Horwitz asked if the City receives part of that money from the County.

Mr. Pfaff stated that he would have to check into that.

Mr. Horwitz stated that there has clearly been an effort to not duplicate services and the idea that only the City's dispatchers can look at a monitor and tell where a vehicle is does not make sense that Beachwood dispatchers are the only ones that do that. Mr. Horwitz stated that Chagrin Valley has 12 cities that operate in their jurisdiction and some of their cities such as Moreland Hills and some of the homes in these cities are far more expensive than homes in Beachwood with properties far more valuable and they appear to be winning awards and operating quite efficiently. Mr. Horwitz stated that they operate more efficiently than Beachwood because if it would cost the City \$800,000 to join their regional dispatch center and the City is now paying \$1.2 million and you look at the cost per call, the City's cost per call is much higher. Mr. Horwitz asked if the cost per call is justified, and he would also like to know the accurate number from Chagrin Valley. Mr. Horwitz stated that he is not saying that he is interested in joining but he would like to have more information

.

SAFETY AND PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE(continued)

Mr. Horwitz stated that back in December of last year, Officer Grein told the newspaper that it would cost Beachwood \$661,000.00 to go with the group at the time that included the City of Shaker Heights, City of University Heights, City of Euclid, and the City of Cleveland Heights. Officer Grein stated that it would save the City \$400,000.00 per year. Mr. Horwitz stated that when that article came out the idea of saving \$400,000.00 per year was heralded as something the City should strive for and that it was a good idea back in December of 2014 and suddenly it is not a good idea to regionalize.

Mr. Horwitz stated that he understands the argument that this model of having the City control the dispatch center but the concept of regionalization was being reported to Council as being a good move and now suddenly regionalization is not a good idea. Mr. Horwitz stated that his understanding is that Chagrin Valley would take some of the City's dispatchers. Mr. Horwitz stated that regarding the radios, analog is on its way out and he has read some article regarding the radios and there are clearly some benefits to having the digital radios that they go farther, the batteries last longer and you can run digital information over them that you cannot run over analog. Mr. Horwitz stated that other dispatch centers are going with digital. Mr. Horwitz stated that we are using old radios because they happen to be cheaper instead of spending the money for the best radios we can get which eventually the City will have to do. Mr. Horwitz stated that he would like to go back and work with the cities that we tried to work with before, they are the City's neighbors and we know them and they know us and there is no County money out there and he has had that confirmed. Mr. Horwitz stated that if there were five cities out there we could still receive some County money instead of paying \$900,000.00 ourselves up front.

Mayor Gorden stated that he would like to set the record straight. The City of Beachwood, Police and Fire has always been in a position to recommend a regional dispatch center. Mayor Gorden stated that the City is still in that position and wants to build a regional dispatch center and what is being proposed is not really just for Beachwood. Mayor Gorden stated that Council is aware that the City took on a neighboring community to test what needed to be done in order to set the pattern for a regional dispatch center. Mayor Gorden stated that is the exact reason that Beachwood took Pepper Pike in so that they could save costs and we can reduce the City's costs. Mayor Gorden stated that Pepper Pike has reduced their costs by coming to the City of Beachwood. Mayor Gorden stated that was the template for the testing of taking on other communities and since we put that forward other communities such as the City of Shaker Heights, City of University Heights, City of Cleveland Heights and the City of Euclid wanted to join the Beachwood regional dispatch center. Mayor Gorden stated that the City of Beachwood's center is still going to be a regional dispatch center. Mayor Gorden stated that the City is building it to take care of the City's needs right now and with the expansion capability of adding additional equipment as soon as other cities sign up.

Mayor Gorden stated that there were neighboring communities that wanted to come on board with the City but the dispatch center was not built.

Mr. Horwitz stated that with all due respect he would love to see the dispatch center here in Beachwood and he would love to see the City in control but the reality is he has obtained the salary schedules for the City of Shaker Heights, the City of University Heights and the City of Cleveland Heights and the model works in the City of Strongsville because in those four cities the dispatchers

SAFETY AND PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE(continued)

have comparable salaries, but the Beachwood dispatchers are higher than the other cities and it does not make economic sense for other cities to come to Beachwood, still pay a buy-in and pay the dispatcher rate that Beachwood is paying. Mr. Horwitz stated that if a dispatcher is making \$18.00-\$24.00 per hour and the City of Beachwood dispatchers are making \$28.00 per hour, if he is running a City he does not necessarily want to go where he will be paying \$28.00 per hour.

Mr. Goodman stated that this is a situation where everybody wants to believe what they want to believe and he would like to call for a vote.

Mr. Isaacson asked to read the following statement, "For the past few months we have been debating options for dispatch. Early in this process I realized that we had not considered a significant option moving to a shared dispatch center. As I did my own research on that, I found that there are entities that seem to offer similar if not identical services at a lower cost. However, as a Councilman, I was only able to take my research so far. Given that, several of my colleagues and I asked the administration to have our experts weigh that option by speaking with the shared dispatch center experts, and, creating a comparison of services and costs than we can make informed decisions that could be justified to our residents. We owe it to the residents of Beachwood to consider all options. Unfortunately, that did not happen. Let me be clear, delivering great public safety services is one of the key functions and that is what we need to keep doing. I haven't made up my mind on this and I don't know if the right option is to keep our emergency dispatch in-house or move it to a shared service but we have not explored all the options. This is much more than costs but we do need to be sure that we are spending our money wisely. I am not comfortable with the information I have to date".

Mr. Wachter stated that if he understands correctly the configuration of the proposed project is four new stations with the capacity to add additional stations.

Chief Winebrenner stated yes with a total capacity of ten work stations.

Mr. Wachter asked if that is the design for the facility and the design for the work stations.

Chief Winebrenner stated yes.

Mr. Wachter stated that in response to some of what he has heard tonight the issue of regionalism is not one that the City is opposed to, in fact, the City is in favor of regionalism and that is why the design of this is such that the City can add additional work stations and by doing that reduce the overall costs.

Mr. Wachter stated that he is persuaded that the control is critical to be in Beachwood and we are a unique community with a senior center that is not duplicated anywhere else and if you look at the north east corner of the community, it generates an enormous amount of calls and he is not persuaded to have dispatch handled anywhere else. Mr. Wachter stated that Beachwood has a

CM 2015-331

SAFETY AND PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE(continued)

unique population that is very demanding and there is also a unique configuration of the City and that cannot be ignored and to ask someone else to handle that, particularly in light of the information we have been given by our experts, he cannot ignore that. Mr. Wachter stated that all we are voting on this evening is the contract with GPD for drawing up the plans and if these numbers come in at the kind of numbers that they have been talking about than I think we should be prepared to move forward with it. Mr. Wachter stated that he is confident, as Mr. Horwitz suggested, that there is money out there that the County has available for additional regionalism and that the Mayor is going to track it down and that it will not be ignored. Mr. Wachter encouraged everyone to move forward on this promptly.

Moved by M.M. Jacobs, seconded by M. Mintz, that Ordinance No. 2015-126 be adopted.

ROLL CALL	Yes:	F.S. Goodman, M.M. Jacobs, M. Mintz, J. Pasch, M.I. Wachter
	Abstain:	M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson.
	No:	None.
	Not Voting:	None.

MOTION ADOPTED

Mr. Jacobs asked Mr. Reali if abstaining goes with the majority vote.

Mr. Reali stated that abstaining always goes with the winning side.

2. A Motion authorizing the Clerk to advertise for bidders for the Dispatch Center Renovation.

Placed on Pending on: September 8, 2015
 Remain on Pending on: September 21, 2015
 Remain on Pending on: October 5, 2015
 Remain on Pending on: October 19, 2015
 Adopted on: November 2, 2015

Moved by M. Mintz seconded by M.M. Jacobs, that the Motion authorizing the Clerk to advertise for bidders for the Dispatch Center Renovation be adopted.

ROLL CALL	Yes:	F.S. Goodman, M.M. Jacobs, M. Mintz, J. Pasch, M.I. Wachter
	Abstain:	M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson.
	No:	None.
	Not Voting:	None.

MOTION ADOPTED

ADJOURNMENT

Moved by F.S. Goodman, seconded by M.I. Wachter, to adjourn the Regular Council Meeting at 8:07 P.M. to the next regularly scheduled Council Meeting.

ADJOURNMENT(continued)

ROLL CALL:	Yes:	F.S. Goodman, M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson, M.M. Jacobs, M. Mintz, J. Pasch, M.I. Wachter
	Abstain:	None.
	No:	None.
	Not Voting:	None.

MOTION ADOPTED

Approved:

Clerk

Mayor