

THE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION MEETING WAS HELD AT BEACHWOOD CITY HALL ON THURSDAY, OCTOBER 30, 2014.

ROLL CALL: PRESENT: Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht, O. Jacobs
J. Pasch, B. Zabell
ABSENT: C. Cohen, B. Mann, M. Wachter
Wm. Griswold, B. Reali
ALSO PRESENT: J. Ciuni, G. Smerigan

A motion was made by B. Zabell and seconded by O. Jacobs to approve the minutes of the September 30, 2014, regular meeting.

ROLL CALL:

AYES:	M. Gorden, R. Hecht, B. Zabell
NAYS:	None
ABSTAIN:	O. Jacobs. J. Pasch

MOTION APPROVED – MINUTES APPROVED

Mr. James Pasch is sitting in for Mr. Mark Wachter who is absent this evening. Mr. Alex Isaccson, Councilmember was also in attendance. Also, Chariman Hecht stated she was handling the Planning and Zoning meeting in the absence of Mr. Bill Mann.

COUNCIL REPORT

Mr. Pasch stated that there was no Council report.

P&Z 2014-21 MAROUS BROTHERS, REPRESENTING SANDRA NOLL, PRESIDENT OF BRIARWOOD MANAGEMENT, LLC, IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY AND FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL TO ADD A SECOND DRIVE APRON AND PROPOSING WIDENING THE EXISTING SITE DRIVE BY FIVE FEET.

A letter was received from the applicant asking to be withdrawn from the Planning and Zoning agenda for October 30, 2014.

Mr. Craig Cohen entered the Planning and Zoning meeting.

P&Z 2014-22 KA ARCHITECTS, REPRESENTING GENERAL GROWTH PROPERTIES, BEACHWOOD MALL, LOCATED AT 26300 CEDAR ROAD IS REQUESTING PRELIMINARY AND FINAL SITE PLAN APPROVAL FOR INFRASTRUCTURE AND UNDERGROUND UTILITIES WORK ON SITE.

Mr. Charles Tapia introduced the group representing General Growth Properties and the proposed expansion project at 26300 Cedar Road. It has been almost a year, representing General Growth, since land purchased was proposed for rezoning. Also present are KA Architects, C. W. Courtney, and Jonathan Limb, Corporate Architect for General Growth. The presentation tonight is for preliminary and final site improvements, which was presented to Council last year.

Mr. James Heller from KA Architects, along with Vic Singh, Landscape architect and site planner, who has worked behind the scenes for some years; Ray Conley, and Mike Prochaska with C.W. Courtney, who are responsible for the civil engineering drawings for the site improvements and landscape. In review, the master site plan proposed the retail shops on the west side of the present mall; two restaurants were proposed on Cedar Road, and a one-story restaurant on Richmond Road with a one hundred foot setback off Richmond Road; a six –foot fence was incorporated for security as well as a buffer to separate the landscape from the parking area on the ring road. At this time there is approval for approximately 77,000 square feet of retail shops and 27,000 square feet of restaurants. There has been some repositioning of the retail shops and restaurants. There have been some modifications to the location of the restaurants on Cedar Road with a shift to the west and a circulation drive has been shifted fifty feet to the west. There is more than the 100 foot setback which is required by Code. There are 64,000 square feet of retail shown on the drawings, which leaves 13,000 square feet to possibly be used later. Also included, as stated in Chapter 1123.06(b10) of the Beachwood Codified Ordinances, are two service courts and extended the Mall Entrance and added an extra driving lane, which will be off of the ring road. It also accommodates the service vehicles. There is a pad shown on the drawings for a possible future restaurant on Richmond Road, which was originally shown. In order to properly screen the service courts, there is going to be provided an electric roll-down doors, which provides screening and security.

Mr. Heller reviewed the actual zoning analysis requirements for the project and showed that all of the areas are well within the codified standards. The setbacks requirements are well within the standards. There are no variances required for this submission. The lower level plan for the Mall indicates no change. There is a four car ratio for the parking.

Mr. Heller stated that there was a commitment made by GGP, during the rezoning period, to provide evergreen trees, ten (10) to twelve (12) feet high, staggered twenty feet on top of a minimum three (3) foot high mound. What was shown as a restaurant on Richmond Road, will now be parking lot. This plan shows a sixty (60) foot buffer which is being provided. The berm is still being installed.

Mr. Prochaska with the C. W. Courtney Company, stated there are evergreen trees, shade trees and ornamental trees. The spruce trees are being maintained and added a row of shade trees along the sidewalk, closest to Richmond Road and also added shade trees along the curb line of the new ring road. The added road will have rows of ornamental trees also. In order to meet the storm water quality requirements, there are bio-retention basins. Basically they treat the water before going into the retention ponds. The plants in the area tolerate wet feet. There is durable, hardy plant materials that are resistant to salt. There are ornamental trees and flowering annuals in the areas.

Mr. Heller stated that in many areas where it looks like grass, there are many more trees. There are many smaller trees that will still exist when this work is completed, but they are not identified

because it is not a requirement for depicting the trees. There was a shift of trees slightly due to having to install piping to connect the bio-swales to meet the storm water management requirements. The sheets show the shade trees, types of trees, number of bushes and the plant materials on the working drawings. One of the major concerns of the residents, as well as the Planning Commission, was the site lighting plan, a photometric plan that showed all the way to Richmond Road. The requirement was that there be cutoff fixtures that are less than .1footcandle of light at the curb on the east side of Richmond Road. There are three-headed fixtures in place of four-headed fixtures. There is a conceptual plan that shows the areas of storm water management that have to be addressed. For the review, the plant lists, size, type of trees, and specifications of all items were submitted. The evergreen trees are 10 to 12 feet in size.

Mr. Smerigan stated that the Building Department, Fire Department and Police Department have raised no issues at this time with regards to the layout.

Mr. Ciuni stated that about a month ago, these plans were reviewed thoroughly and sent a report to C. W Courtney. C. W. Courtney resubmitted revised plans and most of the comments were satisfactorily addressed. The utilities, geometrics, storm water management calculations, electrical and landscaping were reviewed and final approval is recommended contingent upon a couple of items being addressed.

Mr. Heller stated that these items would be complied with. Mr. Tapia stated that these items would be addressed and there are no foreseen problems.

Mr. Smerigan stated that this request is for preliminary and final site plan approval for the site work, which includes the drive-in parking changes, site lighting, landscaping, buffer plans and a conceptual building rendering showing the pads for the future restaurants and the basic footprint for the western addition to the main mall building. The site layout plans are in conformance with the overall concept development plan approved as part of the rezoning for the expansion. The two free-standing restaurants will have to apply for conditional use permits which also include final plans for their architectural treatment, height elevations, lighting, landscaping, signage, etc. That will be a completely separate submission.

Mr. Smerigan continued that as indicated in the box score, the proposed development plan also conforms to the recently adopted requirements of the U-4B Shopping Center District. The proposed site development plan indicates the construction of an additional 64,000 square feet of retail space on the west side of the existing mall building. That additional brings the main mall building to a total of 962,648 square feet. The plan also proposes construction of two restaurants that together total 19,195 square feet. These additions will bring the total retail space at Beachwood Place Mall to 981,843 square feet.

Mr. Smerigan stated that the western expansion of the main mall building will provide for streetscape tenants as permitted in the revisions to Chapter 1123 and shown in the architectural

rendering submitted by the applicant. This approach will make the western entrance to the mall much more attractive and inviting for customers. Two service courts are indicated as part of the new addition. The service courts are proposed to have roll down doors to provide screening from the parking lot. A drop-off is shown at the entrance to the mall. The entrance corridor will be canopied.

Mr. Smerigan stated that the parking plan continues to provide for an outer-ring road to move traffic around the site without interrupting pedestrian flows. Parking lot lighting for the new lot makes use of the same lighting fixtures as on the remainder of the site. The fixtures are cutoffs with shields and the photometric plan indicates compliance with City light spillage standards. The proposed plan meets the minimum parking requirements of the U-4B Shopping Center District both in terms of number of spaces and in terms of dimensional design requirements. The main east-west drive aisle is bordered by landscaped strips and decorative lighting to create a boulevard effect.

The landscape plan indicates a buffer 60 feet in width along the entire frontage of Richmond Road. The landscape plan includes a double row of spruce trees 10-12 feet in height from just north of Hilltop Drive to the northern property. There are rows of canopy trees both in front of and behind the double row of spruce trees. The landscape buffer includes three bio-retention basins, which are necessary to meet storm water quality standards. Those basins are landscaped with appropriate plant materials. The southwest corner of the site is heavily landscaped with a combination of canopy trees, ornamental trees, and evergreen trees. The trees are supplemented with shrubs, grasses, and perennials. The plan is consistent with the standards set forth in the zoning code and previous plan submitted for the rezoning of the property. Behind the landscape materials in the 60 feet of buffer there is a black aluminum fence, six feet in height that extends from George Zeiger Drive to the northerly property line where it curves along the internal drive. The fence has stone columns with pre-cast caps. The columns are 2.67 feet square and extend to a height of 7 feet with the caps.

Mr. Smerigan stated that in summary the proposed expansion complies with the previously approved general development concept plan that accompanied the rezoning and it complies with the provisions of the U-4B Shopping Center District as recently amended by City Council. This plan does not include any of the façade treatment on the west side or any signage. There will be separate applications for these items. An item that came up was the concern for the pads for the restaurants and what happens if these do not materialize. Discussions with Mr. Heller stated that there would be a commitment for landscaping if the restaurants did not go forward.

Mr. Heller stated that he believes that these projects for the restaurants will be moving forward if approval is received for the site improvement this evening.

Mr. Tapia also stated that he believes this is a timing question. With approval possibly this evening, the drawings and movement forward with these projects should be ready to begin the first chance the weather permits in 2015.

Mr. Smerigan stated that preliminary and final site plan approval is recommended with the stipulations of compliance with the comments of the City Engineer.

Mr. Heller stated there the applicant has been working with the electric company (CEI) to move the necessary a series of poles along Richmond Road with transformers. Those will be eliminated and moved northward. It permits GGP to move forward to construct the buffer and landscaping which affects the residents, before any actual construction of the project begins. In the rework of some of the area, there is a short landscape wall to protect the retention basin.

Mr. Jacobs asked if the berm is still three feet and how long will this part of the construction take?

Mr. Heller stated that the berm is at least three feet high and possibly higher and the construction of the landscape and buffer should take about nine months.

Chairperson Hecht asked about the three lane road that took the place of two rows of parking and if that was one lane in and two lanes going out? Is the landscape presented and will be completed as approved.

Mr. Heller stated that the driveway was one lane each way and an offset in the middle. By the ring road you can make a left hand turn and on the inter roadway you can turn left. It is an opposing left turn lane.

Mr. Tapia stated that what has been designed for the completed project either meets or exceeds what was presented at the City Council meeting.

Mr. Pasch asked if there actually was going to be a pad installed on Richmond Road for the possibility of a restaurant at a future time.

Mr. Heller stated that it will paved parking lot, striping and lighting. No pad will be installed at this time. There are also three large trees in the area that are being saved.

Mr. Pasch also stated that as far as winter screening is concerned, is there enough winter trees during the nine months that Cleveland has winter.

Mr. Prochaska stated that there are approximately fifty-one evergreen trees that are along Richmond Road and in the middle area the existing landscaping is going to remain. As you go farther down there have been evergreen shrubs added to the evergreen trees as well.

Mr. Pasch asked what is actually going in new and what is actually staying?

Mr. Prochaska explained that most of the large landscaping remains. There are a large portion of trees that remain on Richmond Road. There will be a heavily evergreen screening. There will be

two rows of deciduous trees, one along the sidewalk on Richmond Road and the other along the ring road. There are shrubs and evergreen and some viburnums that will grow to ten to twelve feet tall.

Mr. Tapia stated there are a lot of trees not shown on the plan due to the size.

Mr. Prochaska stated that the Code says that any tree 13 inches in circumference or greater needed to be tagged, surveyed and showed on the development plan. There are a lot of trees that are three and four inches that will remain.

Mr. Heller stated that he commented before that everything required by the City from a measurement standpoint would be saved and shown on the drawings. There are probably hundreds of trees below the size required that are not shown on the drawings. Those will be saved that are not affected by the grading.

Mr. Pasch asked if there was going to be 70% landscape coverage?

Mr. Smerigan stated that what has been submitted is consistent with what landscape plan was submitted for the rezoning. The level or capacity of screening is difficult to determine on a plan this size. The combination of plant materials are well thought out. There is a combination of planting and the mix of trees with shrubs that will keep the area covered. There will be some loss of shrubbery. There will be a reasonable buffer maintained here. There has to be some tall and short shrubs and trees so there are not bare trees as they get older and taller. The plant material has to be durable for weather conditions.

Mr. Heller stated that there is about 600 feet of trees along Richmond Road. The trees are spaced so far apart to promote growth.

Mr. Cohen asked about the service court yards and if that was for trash. Will the overhead doors face the parking lot and be opened or closed?

Mr. Tapia stated that this area was for indoor and outdoor trash. The doors will only be opened when deliveries arrive.

Mayor Gorden asked about the difference in the proposed retail addition now is 64,000 square feet and the original area was 77,000 square feet. What happened or where was the other 13,000 square feet taken from.

Mr. Heller stated that there was more retail space came and overlapped the northern portion of the west wall of Nordstroms and further north overlapped some of the space at Saks Fifth Avenue. As

this was being developed, the buildings themselves have been refined and the service courts have been enlarged to hold two collection devise. Some of the additional space was also identified in a proposed second story.

Mayor Gorden asked approximately how large an area is the service court where the trucks will enter and then the doors close behind? Are there any safety concerns in this area? If the Police reviewed this, then I am okay with it.

Mr. Heller stated that the service court areas are approximately 70 feet deep. There have been truck studies done to determine the radii. There will be some fairly large tracker trailers coming into this area, as well as step vans. There are service corridors that are not shown, but are part of the building drawings to show how the tenants are serviced. A second means of egress will also be shown. There will be some times that there are as many as four trucks in this area.

Mr. Tapia stated that most of the deliveries occur before mall hours. These service courts make it so that there will be no trash bins in the parking lot or trucks parked waiting to unload the deliveries.

Mayor Gorden asked about the final pad locations of the two restaurants on Cedar and if there has been a change in location. What is expected at the end of the nine-month construction period?

Mr. Tapia stated the restaurants have been pushed back farther from Cedar Road by about fifty feet. In order to maintain desired landscape around the restaurants and the plaza, it was necessary to move the location back.

Mr. Heller stated that the existing ring road will have to be maintained until the new ring road is opened with the new parking area. There will be work done in phases. The entire re-work of the westerly 200 feet plus the 36 foot ring road will be substantially completed in nine months.

Mayor stated that the work shown this evening and that will be done in the next nine months is mostly infrastructure work and no construction of the new buildings proposed.

Mr. Tapia stated that was correct. There may be a little bit of construction on the new building, but mostly it will be site infrastructure work and landscaping.

Mr. Heller stated that there is a lot of ground infrastructure work. There are utilities to be relocated before any foundations, etc. can be started.

Mr. Zabell asked about the restaurants having specific proto-types and specific square footage identified and was wondering if there would be outdoor seating? How many seats are allocated for outdoor seating.

Mr. Tapia stated that typically there is outdoor seating at both restaurants.

Mr. Heller stated that outdoor seating was not included in the square footage of the original size of the restaurants and stated that outdoor seating square footage is not a requirements when there is a center approaching a million square feet.

Mr. Smerigan stated that in this district outdoor seating is not calculated separately. In this district the parking ratio is based on GLA and because of the scope of the center, there is enough flexibility to handle the seasonal parking. During the summer months, the outdoor seating replaces the indoor seating and doesn't change to total volume of customers in the restaurant. It is confident that the parking requirements for the mall the way it is designed will be adequate for the parking demand at that location.

Mr. Zabell asked about the relevance that the additional restaurant pad area on Richmond Road has to do with this evening's approval.

Mr. Smerigan stated that this area is not being approved for a third restaurant. This area is being shown because the approval for the rezoning showed that General Growth Properties has the ability to have a restaurant on the west side of the mall. The applicant has designed this as part of the parking area and would have to come back to the Planning Commission if in the future there should be an application for a restaurant or anything else. This is for reference to the rezoning only and not approving anything for another restaurant.

Mr. Zabell asked about the light spillage and the fact that certain types of lights are being used in the parking lot. When you have arranged the lighting in the manner shown, is this potentially going to be a safety concern if all of the wooded area that is for the requested buffer going to be dark. Has any up-lighting or ground lighting been considered?

Mr. Tapia stated that there are some shields that carry over some light spillage, and also there is lighting along the street that comes back into the property.

Mr. Pasch asked about the three lane drive that is being created and how the effect of the large amount of traffic coming out of the mall in the evening will affect the residents on Richmond Road with their headlights shining?

Mr. Heller stated that the access road falls within the area where there is the buffer and landscape berm and evergreen trees are. The grade of that access road is lower than the buffer area and the elevation of Richmond Road. The grade at the end of the ring road is lower than the three foot berm which is well above the height of any standard car's headlights.

Mr. Tapia stated that deliveries do not start before 7:00-8:00 a.m. and there are UPS, Fed Ex, etc. during the day which accounts for about 10% of deliveries.

A motion was made by O. Jacobs and seconded by C. Cohen to approve KA Architects, representing General Growth Properties, Beachwood Mall, located at 26300 Cedar Road, for preliminary and final site plan approval for infrastructure and underground utilities work on site and contingent upon compliance of the comments of the City Engineer.

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht O. Jacobs, J. Pasch, B. Zabell
	NAYS:	None
	MOTION APPROVED	

A motion was made by J. Pasch and seconded by O. Jacobs to adjourn the meeting

ROLL CALL:	AYES:	C. Cohen, Mayor Gorden, R. Hecht O. Jacobs, J. Pasch, B. Zabell
	NAYS:	None
	MOTION APPROVED – ADJOURNED	

Rochell Hecht, Chairman, ProTem

Sue Ley, Secretary

Karen Navolanic, Clerk of Council